Reporting on Progress Towards Equality of Opportunity for Women and Men Made By Public Authorities in Scotland: Ministerial Priorities for Gender Equality

Tackling Occupational Segregation

Equalities

social research

REPORTING ON PROGRESS TOWARDS EQUALITY OF OPPORTUNITY FOR WOMEN AND MEN MADE BY PUBLIC AUTHORITIES IN SCOTLAND: MINISTERIAL PRIORITIES FOR GENDER EQUALITY

TACKLING OCCUPATIONAL SEGREGATION

REID HOWIE ASSOCIATES / EQUALITY PLUS

Scottish Government Social Research
2010

The views expressed in this report are those of the researcher and do not necessarily represent those of the Scottish Government or Scottish Ministers.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD

I am delighted to introduce the Scottish Ministers' reports on our gender equality priorities to tackle occupational segregation and to tackle violence against women.

The Scottish Government is working with others to ensure that Scotland is a country where girls and boys and women and men no longer face barriers and discrimination which prevent them from being the best that they can be. We are committed to creating a more successful country, with opportunities for all of Scotland to flourish. This is at the heart of our Economic Strategy and underpins the national performance framework.

The public sector duty to promote gender equality helps us and the wider public sector to deliver the changes that are needed to make real improvements to women and men's lives. The duty is an instrument to drive both institutional and cultural change. It ensures that public organisations systematically consider the impact of all their policies and services on women and on men and are active in finding ways to remove disadvantage and discrimination.

In addition to the duty on public authorities, there is a duty on Scottish Ministers. This Scottish Ministers' Duty enables us to determine priorities for advancing gender equality across the public sector as a whole and to report on progress. Our two priorities are to tackle occupational segregation and to tackle violence against women.

In response to the Scottish Ministers' Duty, we have published 2 reports on each of the priority areas (4 reports in total, each with an accompanying research summary). The reports focus on the good practice taking place in some public authorities in tackling occupational segregation and in violence against women. We would encourage other authorities to consider adopting or adapting the identified good practice to suit their local area, helping us to make a real difference and deliver better outcomes for women and men in Scotland.

NICOLA STURGEON
DEPUTY FIRST MINISTER AND CABINET SECRETARY FOR HEALTH AND WELLBEING

JUNE 2010

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report sets out the findings of research to identify progress by public authorities in one of two areas designated in Scotland as ministerial priorities under the Gender Equality Duty: tackling occupational segregation. Occupational segregation is the concentration of women and men in different kinds of jobs ("horizontal" segregation) or at different grades ("vertical" segregation). Occupational segregation is linked to, and is a consequence of, wider gender inequality, as well as being a continuing barrier to the achievement of equality. The gender pay gap is the difference between earnings for women and men.

There is clear evidence that occupational segregation continues to be a significant problem in Scottish society (both horizontal and vertical) with considerable evidence of gender inequality in employment. There is also evidence of the gender pay gap.

The Gender Equality Duty was introduced in the Equality Act 2006. This amended the Sex Discrimination Act 1976 and places a 'general duty' and 'specific duties' on listed public authorities. It requires that a listed public authority "shall in carrying out its functions have due regard to the need - (a) to eliminate unlawful discrimination and harassment, and (b) to promote equality of opportunity between men and women." Additionally, Scottish Ministers are required to set out priority areas that they have identified across the functions and activities of relevant Scottish public authorities. In June 2009, following consultation with a wide range of stakeholders, Scottish Ministers agreed two priority areas for the advancement of equality of opportunity between women and men in Scotland: tackling occupational segregation and tackling violence against women. Scottish Ministers are required to provide an overview of progress in these priority areas by 1 July 2010, and at least every 3 years thereafter.

It is important to note, however, that the legal framework for equality is changing significantly. The Equality Act 2010 brings together and simplifies a range of equalities legislation, and includes a new Single Equality Duty. Scottish Ministers have consulted on the specific duties to be placed on public authorities and expect to publish proposals in Summer 2010. In the meantime, Scottish Ministers are required to meet their duty to report on progress towards equality of opportunity for women and men made by public authorities in Scotland as set out in current legislation.

The research involved: an evidence review of research, statistical data and Scottish Government policy (carried out by the Scottish Government); a document review covering a sample of 72 public authorities and 3 umbrella organisations (carried out by Reid Howie Associates and Equality Plus); case studies covering 31 public authorities (carried out by Reid Howie Associates and Equality Plus); analysis and report writing.

The research identified many examples of work to tackle occupational segregation, including developments to structures, strategy and policy; information gathering, monitoring and reporting; initiatives and specific work; and training and awareness raising. While this report cannot draw specific conclusions about the <u>level</u> of change which has been achieved in tackling occupational segregation in recent years, nor the particular impact of all of the separate work, it is reasonable to infer that these developments indicate overall progress in tackling occupational segregation, and

suggest positive changes in addressing this. The developments summarised below and described in the report are likely to have had an impact upon, for example: the overall context for tackling occupational segregation; the nature of policy and information; provision made and work undertaken; recognition and understanding of the issues; and the overall experiences of those affected by occupational segregation.

However, the research also found variation in the extent and nature of work undertaken and in understanding of the issues. It was recognised that there remains a need to develop work to address occupational segregation in Scotland.

Structures, strategy and policy

The overall structural arrangements through which public authorities work to tackle occupational segregation, along with related legislation (outlined above), strategies and policies, set the context within which other developments and initiatives take place. The research identified a number of relevant developments in relation to organisational structures at a national level and in specific public authorities which were relevant to addressing occupational segregation.

Relevant national structures were identified. Additionally, among public authorities in this research, occupational segregation issues were found to be addressed largely through one (or both) of two main routes: the structures for dealing with and reporting upon equality issues and those for human resources (HR) issues. The main developments found in relation to overall structures included: the establishment or development of specific groups to consider equality and diversity issues (including occupational segregation); and the identification of a team or individual to take the work forward. In some organisations, arrangements were found to be in place to consider occupational segregation directly, and these included both general and project-specific working groups, networking arrangements and forums. Links to other equalities work were identified as being made through equality schemes, networking by staff or shared reporting arrangements.

Regardless of the structural arrangements in place, the role of particular staff in addressing occupational segregation (including HR staff, specialist equalities staff and, in the education sector, careers and guidance staff) was identified in most organisations.

Most work to address occupational segregation was found to take place within public authorities, although examples of partnership working were also identified, most commonly involving higher and further education institutions, but also others. Examples were identified of work involving specialist organisations which were not themselves public authorities, but which received public funding (e.g. "Close the Gap" and the Scottish Resource Centre for Women in Science, Engineering and Technology).

There was also evidence of developments in the identification of aims, objectives and commitments at a national level and among some organisations in relation to tackling occupational segregation. While there was considerable evidence of organisations having objectives, aims or commitments at a broad level related to tackling equality, gender inequality and relevant issues, a smaller number specifically

mentioned occupational segregation. Where specific objectives, aims or commitments were in place, these generally focused on tackling occupational segregation overall; tackling both vertical and horizontal segregation within an organisation's workforce; tackling the gender pay gap; tackling occupational segregation in the community; or collecting data on occupational segregation. In a small number of cases, references were made to tackling occupational segregation in other documents, for example, business and corporate plans, Single Outcome Agreements and Equal Pay Statements.

Relevant national strategies and policies were identified. Among specific organisations a majority indicated that strategies or plans were in place to tackle occupational segregation, although these were largely wider strategies (for example, equality or diversity strategies, or HR strategies). A small number of examples of a specific strategy or plan relating to occupational segregation were identified, as well as some examples of equal pay action plans.

Close links were identified in many organisations between tackling occupational segregation and workforce policies and practices, and there were examples of progress and developments to these. Among relevant policies and practices identified, although the nature and level of provision varied, were: flexible working; maternity, paternity and parental leave (and related policies); equal pay; and overall equality and diversity policies. Among a range of other relevant policies identified were: recruitment and selection; admissions; training and development; appraisal; various aspects of fair treatment at work; and some policies specific to particular forms or areas of work. There was evidence that some new policies or practices had been developed, and some existing provisions had been extended.

The Scottish Government's evidence review noted a Government commitment to mainstreaming gender equality, and most of the participants in this research were able to identify perceived developments towards mainstreaming work of relevance to tackling occupational segregation. The most common examples were: the development of understanding; consideration of the issue through mainstream structures; and embedding the issue in mainstream strategies, plans or projects.

Information gathering, monitoring and reporting

A further key element in addressing occupational segregation is identifying the nature and extent of the issue and assessing change, both of which require mechanisms for information gathering, monitoring and reporting. The research identified developments in this type of work at a national level and in many of the organisations involved.

Relevant national statistics were identified and many specific organisations in this research made reference to gathering information pertinent to addressing occupational segregation, largely data on the make-up of their workforce by gender. In some cases, this information collection was more detailed, focusing on, for example, grades, scales, hours and types of work. Further issues identified frequently were the collection of information on recruitment and selection, sometimes including applications received; and training. Several also identified undertaking a regular review or audit of equal pay. Some were also found to gather information on other issues, such as promotion, or the take-up of various forms of support (e.g.

flexible working, support for carers and childcare vouchers). There were examples within educational organisations of the collection of information relating to numbers of students, subject choices and attainment.

In addition to statistical information, there was some evidence of the collection of relevant information through consultation, involvement or engagement. A range of methods were identified as being used with staff, community members and other stakeholders, including focus groups, surveys, on-line materials and other techniques. In some cases, engagement focused on a number of aspects of equality, or gender equality, while in other cases, this was specific to an aspect of occupational segregation. There were some examples of consultation with specific groups which might have a particular interest in the issues. A small number of examples were identified of the collection of information through evaluation.

A substantial number of Equality Impact Assessments (EQIAs) were found to have been undertaken on employment-related policies, and some organisations highlighted developments to the EQIA processes overall, or to the provision of training to those undertaking these. Fewer, however, had a direct focus on occupational segregation although some (in areas such as equal pay and grading, HR policies, recruitment, and, in some cases, specific projects), were seen to have led to changes to policy or practice which would impact on this. A number of participants indicated that there was potential for more use of EQIAs to make specific links to occupational segregation.

There was considerable variation in the extent to which information gathered was analysed, interpreted and presented. The most common data presented in equality schemes and annual reports was statistical workforce or student information by gender, although some public authorities provided substantial additional information of various types. Some also provided commentaries and / or community, labour market or sectoral contextual information relating to occupational segregation.

Both the document review and case studies provided evidence of perceived changes to employment patterns. Several organisations indicated positive findings, or improvements, particularly in relation to vertical (but also sometimes horizontal) segregation in their own organisations. Some organisations gave examples of positive changes in: the representation of women at senior levels; employment in non-traditional areas; subject choice, courses and vocational training; and equal pay. In some cases, observed changes were linked to specific work undertaken by public authorities (described in more detail later). However, alongside examples of progress, there was also considerable evidence of a recognition of the need for continuing action to address occupational segregation, in many cases linked to the identification of patterns which suggested continuing issues.

A wide variety of means of reporting (particularly of statistical information) were identified, perhaps reflecting the range of reporting structures involved. There were relevant national publications, and a number of specific organisations provided some information as part of annual reporting on their schemes. Some prepared periodic reports on workforce or other relevant issues. Other examples of the use of data included: review, audit or analysis of material; further research; provision of management information; identification of actions; contribution to wider data; dissemination of information, feedback and follow-up.

Several organisations made a commitment to continuing, or improving information collection. A number of organisations identified changes or improvements planned to information gathering, including: collection of additional information; additional survey work; improvements to the means of data collection or systems; improved analysis; developments to performance measurement; improved reporting; and better use of EQIAs.

Initiatives and specific work

A number of organisations identified the need for initiatives and specific work to address occupational segregation. They also highlighted ways in which such work could have an impact on tackling occupational segregation, through raising and addressing the issues both at overall group and individual level, and enabling change.

The research found a number of examples of initiatives and specific work to address occupational segregation at a national and organisational level. A majority of organisations in this research were found to be carrying out at least some work of this type, although there were variations in its extent and nature. The main types of work identified included: overall positive action programmes and employment initiatives; measures to recruit and encourage entry to non-traditional areas; support to individuals; and research and funding work.

Examples were identified of positive action programmes and initiatives. Some were large scale positive action programmes to tackle occupational segregation across an organisation. There were also examples of programmes to encourage under-represented groups to enter specific sectors or occupations. In some cases, these initiatives worked with, or had links to specific industry or sector bodies, forums or organisations. There were also examples of initiatives designed to encourage and enable women into management and senior posts.

Some organisations also identified the relevance of wider employment programmes and economic or regeneration initiatives, even where their purpose may not be identified specifically as tackling occupational segregation. The importance of programmes such as Modern Apprenticeships, Skillseekers and other forms of vocational training was noted, as well as other targeted employment initiatives.

Examples were also identified of the development and use of measures to recruit and encourage entry to non-traditional areas. There were many examples of work undertaken to promote awareness of opportunities for work in non-traditional areas, or progression. Developments to advertising and recruitment processes were identified, including the use of targeted advertising and marketing. Some organisations had undertaken reviews of, or made changes to advertising and other materials, as well as their methods, to ensure that these were appropriate, and did not promote or perpetuate stereotypes. There was also evidence of work taking place to review learning and teaching materials, as well as aspects of the curriculum to ensure that these were appropriate.

A number of public authorities were found to use events, roadshows and awareness days to promote both careers in non-traditional areas, and to try to break down areas of horizontal occupational segregation within organisations. Some organisations

were found to use other means, such as taster sessions, secondments, job shadowing, work placements and work experience. There was also evidence of the use of role models, as well as case studies, to promote non-traditional work areas. Among other examples identified, one local authority had used financial incentives, while another was considering the use of social networking sites to tackle occupational segregation. A small number of organisations identified the use of the press and television to promote particular issues.

Many references were identified to organisations following good equalities practice in recruitment processes and procedures, and this was widely seen to impact upon tackling occupational segregation. Some identified particular changes or improvements to their approach. In some cases, authorities suggested that they had carried out specific reviews of their processes to identify and address barriers. Some provided examples of ways in which they had used alternative techniques in recruitment process, including telephone and online applications, practical tests, and informal processes. Examples were also given of the involvement of relevant gender organisations in recruitment, a guaranteed interview approach for women taking part in a positive action programme, and a drop-in surgery for ethnic minority women.

A variety of forms of support to individuals were also identified as being provided, to enable them to work in non-traditional occupations, or to enable their progression. Examples of this included a range of mentoring programmes (and work to develop mentors), the development of specific support and advice, and support networks (largely, although not exclusively for women). In some cases, organisations were found to actively promote membership of networks and related events among relevant staff groups.

A number of other examples were identified of personal support provided to both individuals and groups. This included the establishment of single gender teams (e.g. a women-only team in a traditionally male-dominated work area) and provision for girls and young women (e.g. computer clubs). Other examples included: "buddy" systems; peer support to women in business; support to ethnic minority women; support to people with caring responsibilities; and access to specific career or personal development advice. Examples were identified of work by careers advisors with young people and, in some cases, with parents, to help overcome stereotypes in career and subject choice. Examples were also identified of the development of awareness among staff providing advice.

Many organisations identified developments in employment provisions which could help to address occupational segregation. It was clear that many organisations had taken steps to review employment provision, and to amend this where necessary, as well as extending provisions to more staff, or ensuring that both women and men took up opportunities. There were also many examples of actions to make staff aware of provisions available to them, including procedures to make staff on maternity leave, career breaks and other forms of leave aware of opportunities. A number of organisations also identified actions relating to the provision of childcare, or childcare vouchers for staff. Actions relating to equal pay were also highlighted frequently, with some mentioning equal pay statements and equal pay reviews (and related processes). Local authorities (through single status) and the NHS (through Agenda for Change) had gone through wide-ranging and structured programmes of

review and, where necessary, re-grading. A small number of organisations mentioned specific work with "Close the Gap" to address equal pay issues.

A number of organisations had undertaken, or were planning to undertake research relevant to addressing occupational segregation, with a range of examples identified of subject areas and issues.

A small number of organisations also identified that they had a role in tackling occupational segregation through the provision of funding, including funding for both specialist organisations and specific projects and initiatives. The provision of national funding was highlighted in the Scottish Government's evidence review.

Training and awareness raising

A number of participants identified the importance of training and awareness raising in terms of developing understanding and awareness of occupational segregation, informing practice, promoting opportunities and addressing individual experiences. Examples of such work were identified in the Scottish Government's evidence review and in this research. This study identified that most authorities had undertaken training or awareness raising which was relevant in some way to tackling occupational segregation. Many of the schemes and annual reports described developments to equality training generally, while some more specific examples of training relating to addressing occupational segregation (or particular aspects of this) were also found. Some training or awareness raising was found to have been targeted towards staff and managers, while other work was targeted towards members of the community.

The research identified two main types of training and awareness raising for staff in organisations: provision for managers and staff to develop their own understanding of the issues and guide their practice; and training and awareness raising aimed at members of under-represented groups to address their experiences of occupational segregation.

Much of the work relating to the development of practice and understanding among staff was found to be at the level of general equality training and awareness raising, or training or awareness raising about gender equality. This was found to be directed towards a wide variety of groups, ranging from all staff, to those in specific roles, or those who undertook specific tasks (such as recruitment, conducting EQIAs etc.).

In a smaller number of cases, examples were given of training and awareness raising specific to occupational segregation. In some cases, this related to developing a general awareness of issues such as stereotyping, the gender pay gap or opportunities in non-traditional areas. In other cases, the focus was on specific policies or practices (such as flexible working or appraisal). In some cases, training or awareness raising was linked to developing skills such as mentoring or coaching.

There were also a number of examples of other means of developing practice and understanding among staff through awareness raising and the provision of guidance, tools and other advice. In some cases the material was generic (for example, relating to managing diversity) but with specific sections on occupational segregation. In other cases, the guidance was focused on one or more specific aspect of

occupational segregation. The use of the "Teachers' Toolkit on Gender Equality in Education" produced by Learning and Teaching Scotland was also noted, as well as other guidance on work with children and young people.

A number of examples were provided of training and awareness raising to address individual experiences of occupational segregation, particularly work to enable staff to progress within an organisation (generally through personal and leadership development). A number of organisations highlighted their general training and development programmes in this context, as a means of enabling staff (often women) to progress. A small number of examples were identified of gender-specific training, including the use of the "Springboard Women's Development Programme" and the "Navigator Men's Development Programme".

Although most of the training to address individual experiences of occupational segregation for staff focused on provision to enable progression to more senior positions, one local authority identified using positive action training programmes to allow women and men to access training in non-traditional roles.

There were a small number of examples of the provision of (or access to) training through a women's network or development organisation. A number of examples were also given of other forms of training or awareness raising, such as seminars, workshops and events (generally relating to developing opportunities for progression).

Examples were also identified of training and awareness raising among community members to address occupational segregation, involving work to address overall understanding of occupational segregation, and training aimed at enabling people to enter employment or undertake courses in non-traditional areas. Examples of training and awareness raising aimed at developing understanding or changing attitudes of members of the community (or specific groups within this) included: campaign work; community awareness raising as part of other initiatives; the inclusion of issues in equality or diversity awareness raising events; and work with specific groups (e.g. parents or young people). Within schools, some authorities noted using "Career Box" with children of varying ages and there were also examples of the use of other curricular and play materials to raise awareness of stereotyping and promote gender awareness. There were also examples of the discussion of issues in overall work with children and young people. A number of examples of theatre productions were also found, and a small number of examples noted of work with youth groups, or issue-based youth work.

As with staff within organisations, there were also examples of provision which focused on addressing individual experiences of occupational segregation, or developing opportunities in non-traditional roles for members of the wider community. Within colleges and universities, examples were identified of training and courses designed to promote or assist entry to non-traditional roles. A number of these (relating to, for example, construction or childcare) were gender-specific, and some training and awareness raising undertaken with members of the wider community was linked to positive action initiatives. More widely, a number of examples of initiatives designed to assist women to return to work, or to go into business, were identified (sometimes with a specific component dealing with, for example, stereotyping or entering non-traditional roles).

Examples were also identified of work through Modern Apprenticeships, work experience and vocational training, and it was identified that the promotion of non-traditional areas of work was a key national focus of these programmes. Access or preparatory courses (or less formal events) were also identified, designed to encourage consideration of courses in non-traditional areas, or work in non-traditional roles. A small number of examples were identified of work to enable women in the community to progress in their sector (e.g. developments to qualifications).

A number of authorities identified practical ways in which they had tried to break down barriers which perpetuate aspects of occupational segregation. These included: giving consideration to the timing, location, venues and methods used for training and events; staffing of courses and at events; consideration of transport; and provision of other support.

Enabling factors, constraints and suggested developments

While the main focus of the research was on the identification of positive developments in tackling occupational segregation, it was also considered important to acknowledge the need to continue to address occupational segregation in Scotland. The research sought to identify enabling factors and constraints in carrying out such work, and developments required in the future. Enabling factors and constraints were found in the following categories: the national context; the organisational context; knowledge and understanding; ways of working; information and other resources; and other issues.

The importance of clear leadership and direction at a national level was identified, along with a visible high priority for tackling occupational segregation. Some identified that the Gender Equality Duty itself had been an important lever in taking work forward. Other factors included the national focus on equal pay and other imperatives and initiatives (e.g. Curriculum for Excellence). Some authorities suggested, however, that there was not currently a clear national "lead" nor a "clear steer" on occupational segregation. It was also suggested that advice and guidance was not always readily accessible, the focus on gender equality had been "diluted" and there was a lack of accountability for actions.

Within organisations, key enabling factors included support and commitment, an appropriate structure and staff with a remit to support the work. Some identified the benefits of a supportive overall culture, positive role models and a general commitment to equality as helping to enable work. Conversely, a number identified difficulties with the culture within their organisation (or parts of this) which could constrain work. Structural factors were also identified as important, including the benefits of the presence of a group (or network) to take a lead and monitor progress and an overall strategic approach, along with policy and practice developments. Some constraints included: a lack of clear means of addressing issues; a bureaucratic approach; a lack of influence; resistance to change; and issues with the size and circumstances of the organisation. Staff with specific responsibilities for this area of work were identified as beneficial, along with "buy-in" at all levels (although there were seen to be variations in the extent of this).

The level of knowledge and understanding of equalities issues generally, as well as occupational segregation, was also identified as a key factor. However, there was a recognition that the level of this varied between and across authorities, with implications for the way in which work had developed, and how it could be taken forward. Specific concerns were expressed about the level of understanding of the gender inequality underpinning occupational segregation, and the concept of positive action, again with implications for the work which could be developed. There were also some issues raised with the use of EQIAs, the processes involved and perceived variations in their quality.

In terms of ways of working, the links between good practice in general equalities work and the development of work to tackle occupational segregation were highlighted. The need for effective mainstreaming was also noted, although a range of constraints to this were identified (including factors such as senior management commitment, lack of understanding, modes of working and staff buy-in). The benefits of partnership working, information sharing and links to other strategic decision making were also highlighted, although it was acknowledged that there had been some limitations to such work to date.

The key role of data in helping to make the case for work to address occupational segregation was identified as an enabling factor, although it was noted that there were currently gaps in coverage, detail, consistency and use of data. Several organisations highlighted the importance of financial resources in enabling work to tackle occupational segregation, but identified some constraints to this. Some questioned the level of priority given to tackling occupational segregation. The wider financial climate was also seen to constrain work, in terms of issues such as the limited level of recruitment and other factors. There were also seen to be constraints to other resources (e.g. staff, materials and time).

A number of organisations identified occupational segregation as affected by a range of other constraints outwith the control of specific organisations. Some identified general difficulties in "making a difference" or suggested that there had been limited work undertaken to address specific issues for groups such as people from ethnic minority communities and others who may experience a range of barriers in combination.

Among the key developments identified as being required at a national and local level were: leadership and policy direction; clear, transparent and appropriate structures; good equalities practice and mainstreaming; improvements in the level of understanding of the issue; better monitoring and reporting; new initiatives with a wide range of participants; and the provision of resources to support the work.

> The reporting approach has been to focus on the good practice of a sample of public authorities (not named in the report) in tackling occupational segregation. If the reader is interested to contact a 'good practice' authority to find out more, they should contact the following Scottish Government mailbox: scottishministersgenderduty@scotland.gsi.gov.uk and the Scottish Government will seek agreement from the 'good practice' public authority to release their contact details.

SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXT

1.1   This report sets out the findings of research to identify progress by public authorities in one of two areas designated in Scotland as ministerial priorities under the Gender Equality Duty: tackling occupational segregation. It should be read alongside a report by the Scottish Government of an evidence review of relevant research, statistical data and Scottish Government policy, providing the national context[1]. As well as these reports focusing on tackling occupational segregation, parallel reports cover progress relating to the other ministerial priority of tackling violence against women[2].

1.2   This section provides a brief outline of the nature of occupational segregation in Scotland, and an outline of the Gender Equality Duty and legislative context. It also describes the nature of the research undertaken and the parameters of the report[3].

The nature of occupational segregation in Scotland[4]

1.3   Occupational segregation is the concentration of women and men in different kinds of jobs ("horizontal" segregation) or at different grades ("vertical" segregation). Occupational segregation is linked to, and is a consequence of, wider gender inequality, as well as being a continuing barrier to the achievement of equality. The gender pay gap is the difference between earnings for women and men.

1.4   There is clear evidence that occupational segregation continues to be a significant problem in Scottish society (both horizontal and vertical) with considerable evidence of gender inequality in employment. There is also evidence of the gender pay gap. There are differences in the occupations in which women and men predominate. There are also differences in the levels at which women and men are concentrated. Subject choices in school and higher education also follow a gendered pattern, as does vocational education. Some of the findings of the Scottish Government's in-house evidence review were that:

- Men dominate agriculture, forestry and fishing (82.2%); energy and water (77.3%); manufacturing (77.7%); construction (82.6%) and

---

[1] Scottish Government (2010) *Reporting on Progress Towards Equality of Opportunity for Women and Men made by Public Authorities in Scotland: Ministerial Priorities for Gender Equality. Tackling Occupational Segregation: A Review of Key Evidence and National Policies*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.

[2] Scottish Government (2010) *Reporting on Progress Towards Equality of Opportunity for Women and Men made by Public Authorities in Scotland: Ministerial Priorities for Gender Equality. Tackling Violence Against Women: A Review of Key Evidence and National Policies*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.

Reid-Howie Associates and Equality Plus (2010) *Reporting on Progress Towards Equality of Opportunity for Women and Men made by Public Authorities in Scotland: Ministerial Priorities for Gender Equality. Tackling Violence Against Women*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.

[3] There are overlaps between the reports on tackling occupational segregation and tackling violence against women, in terms of the background and methodology, the rationale for the specific issues explored and some of the general findings. Where appropriate, this is reflected in the use of an overall report structure and some material which is common to both, although the detailed findings for each of the priorities are different.

[4] For a full discussion of these issues, see the report of the Scottish Government's in-house evidence review.

transport and communication (73.1%). Women are most likely to be found in public administration, education and health (73.0%).

- Male workers are more likely to be in the most prominent positions within an organisation, such as managers and senior officials or professional occupations. Women are more likely to be found in what are considered to be lower levels in administrative roles, personal service occupations, and sales and customer service occupations.
- Women face a "sticky floor" which traps them in low paid, low skilled and often part-time jobs; and a "glass ceiling", which prevents them from accessing the most senior positions, where they remain under-represented.
- In Scotland in 2009 men working full-time earned 8.6% per hour more than women working full-time, using the median earnings figure.
- Women typically are responsible for childcare and informal care of relatives or friends, both of which limit their labour market opportunities.
- Gendered subject choices in school and further and higher education appear to limit girls' future career opportunities and earning potential, and vocational education such as Modern Apprenticeships remains gender segregated.

1.5   These patterns and resultant inequalities are linked to a range of cultural, social and educational issues, and the causes include gender stereotyping. Occupational segregation is closely linked to the gender pay gap. It also contributes to pension poverty for women and has a high cost to those affected and to the wider economy.

The nature of the Gender Equality Duty and the legislative context

1.6   The Gender Equality Duty was introduced in the Equality Act 2006. This amended the Sex Discrimination Act 1976, and places a 'general duty' and 'specific duties' on listed public bodies. Both parts of the duty came into force in Scotland in April 2007. The general duty requires that:

> *A public authority shall in carrying out its functions have due regard to the need -*
> *(a) to eliminate unlawful discrimination and harassment, and*
> *(b) to promote equality of opportunity between men and women.*

1.7   The specific duties[5] require that a listed public authority must:

- prepare and publish a gender equality scheme, showing how it will meet its general and specific duties and setting out its gender equality objectives.
- consider the need to include objectives to address the causes of any gender pay gap.
- gather and use information on how the public authority's policies and practices affect gender equality in the workforce and in the delivery of services.

---

[5] Set out in the Sex Discrimination (Public Authorities) (Statutory Duties) (Scotland) Order 2007.

- consult stakeholders (i.e. employees, service users and others, including trade unions) and take account of relevant information in order to determine its gender equality objectives.
- assess the impact of its current and proposed policies and practices on gender equality, and pay due regard to the results of those impact assessments.
- implement the actions set out in its scheme within three years, unless it is unreasonable or impracticable to do so.
- report against the scheme every year and review the scheme at least every three years.

1.8   In addition, listed Scottish public authorities with at least 150 full-time equivalent staff must prepare and publish an equal pay policy statement and report on and review this every three years[6].

1.9   Additionally, Scottish Ministers are required to set out priority areas that they have identified across the functions and activities of relevant Scottish authorities. In June 2009, following consultation with a wide range of stakeholders, Scottish Ministers agreed two priority areas for the advancement of equality of opportunity between women and men in Scotland: tackling occupational segregation and tackling violence against women. Scottish Ministers are required to provide an overview of progress in these priority areas by 1st July 2010, and at least every 3 years thereafter.

1.10   It is important to note, however, that the legal framework for equality is changing significantly. The Equality Act 2010 brings together and simplifies a range of equalities legislation, and includes a new Single Equality Duty. Scottish Ministers have consulted on the specific duties to be placed on public authorities and expect to publish proposals in Summer 2010. In the meantime, Scottish Ministers are required to meet their duty to report on progress towards equality of opportunity for women and men made by public authorities in Scotland as set out in current legislation. This report has been prepared to inform that reporting in relation to tacking occupational segregation.

The nature of the research / methodology

1.11   The methodology for the research involved four main strands:

- An evidence review of research, statistical data and Scottish Government policy (carried out in-house by the Scottish Government).
- A document review covering a sample of 72 public authorities and 3 umbrella organisations (carried out by Reid Howie Associates and Equality Plus).
- Case studies covering 31 public authorities (carried out by RHA and Equality Plus).
- Analysis and report writing.

1.12   A summary of the methodology is set out below. The methodology is described in full in Annex 1.

---

[6] There is also specific equal pay legislation (Equal Pay Act 1970).

Scottish Government evidence review

1.13 The Scottish Government's evidence review involved in-house desk-based research to scope, collate and review research evidence, statistical data and Scottish Government policy documents in the context of the two priority areas. The purpose was to set progress reporting in context in relation to the relevant key research and statistical evidence bases and key national Scottish Government policy drivers. A wide range of evidence was examined, and some of the key findings are discussed briefly within this report. As noted, a separate, more detailed report of these findings has been prepared by the Scottish Government.

Document review

1.14 The document review involved the examination of written evidence of work to tackle the priority areas. A sample for the document review was drawn from the more than 300 public authorities covered by the Gender Equality Duty. The sample was chosen to reflect the need both to include different geographical locations, sizes and types of public authority, and to ensure that organisations whose operational role was especially relevant to tackling the issues were included.

1.15 The sample included a total of 75 organisations, comprising: all 8 police forces; 18 local authorities (including 18 education authorities); one education authority which operates as an independent school; 7 NHS boards; 10 further education institutions; 5 universities; 7 individual organisations with a key role in addressing one or both of the issues (tackling occupational segregation or violence against women); 8 individual organisations with a relevant role in addressing one or both of the issues; 8 other organisations; and 3 umbrella bodies.

1.16 A range of documents (including gender equality and single equality schemes; strategies; action plans; update reports; and other documents) were included in the document review. These were summarised using a reading framework, and transferred to a database.

Case studies

1.17 A total of 31 case studies were carried out with public authorities covered by the document review to examine the work undertaken in more detail. These covered: 6 police forces; 11 local authorities and corresponding education authorities; 4 NHS boards; 7 colleges and universities; and 3 specialist national organisations. Within this, all of the relevant public authorities in two geographical areas were selected to provide examples of partnership working.

1.18 A total of 102 staff participated in individual or group discussions (almost all face-to-face, with 4 individual interviews undertaken by telephone). Interview schedules were designed to cover staff with a variety of responsibilities. Most interviews and group discussions covered both of the priorities, even where the main focus of the discussion was upon one issue or the other.

Analysis and reporting

1.19 All of the material was analysed and presented qualitatively. It would have been inappropriate to carry out a quantitative analysis for a number of reasons which are detailed in Annex 1.

1.20 Data from both the document review and case studies were entered into an Access database. The database was used to generate a series of Word documents covering each of the issues within the reading frameworks and interview schedules, tied to a unique identifier for each public authority. The large amount of qualitative material in these documents was analysed to identify overall "themes" pertaining to that issue, as well as "sub-themes" and issues from individual organisations. This method allowed the data to be organised and summarised systematically, while maintaining the richness of the source data and ensuring that the evidence for inclusion in the reports was generated from the material.

1.21 A structure for the final report was agreed with the Scottish Government, with the focus upon the findings of the document review and case studies (although reference is made to the Scottish Government's in-house evidence review). The remaining sections of the report present the findings.

The parameters of the report

1.22 The content of the report focuses on specific work to address occupational segregation, although most public authorities were also found to be undertaking wider equalities work which may impact indirectly on this. Work of this kind is not covered in this report, except where it has a direct relevance to addressing occupational segregation.

1.23 Throughout the report, examples are provided of the kinds of work being undertaken. Reference is often made to the type of public authority which highlighted this work, either in a published document or in a case study interview. It should be noted, however, that, in some cases, the work described may have taken place in partnership with, or through other organisations. It should also be noted that similar types of work may also be being undertaken by other public authorities.

1.24 The report focuses largely on the period from April 2007 to April 2010, although some work which commenced before April 2007 may be included where it provides the overall context, or where it continued into the period of this research. It should also be noted that some of the examples provided relate to work which is now complete, and not all of the work highlighted is current or ongoing.

1.25 It is also important to recognise that this report does not constitute an evaluation or audit of the work being undertaken by public authorities to address occupational segregation. The focus of the research was primarily on the identification of examples of progress, rather than an assessment of gaps. As such, the sample was selected to include those considered most likely to generate such examples, and was not random. Additionally, no comment is offered on the quality or effectiveness of the policies and initiatives identified in the text, and the identification of examples does not indicate their endorsement or evaluation.

1.26 Related to this, as noted in the methodology, the research centred on the use of documentary material and case study interviews with public authorities. It did not seek other stakeholders' views. Some evaluation material has been included in the document review where published evaluations of specific work were identified through the document search, or where these were specifically provided by case study participants. Such material was, however, limited, and where evaluation material was available, there was considerable variation in the nature of this. Where this has been included, the purpose is to provide examples rather than to assess the work described.

1.27 It is also recognised that a report such as this cannot draw specific conclusions about the level of change which has been achieved in tackling occupational segregation in recent years, nor the particular impact of all of the separate work which is described in the report. It would be clearly impossible to measure change in this way, to establish cause and effect, or to identify the impact of each of the many individual examples of developments. It is, however, reasonable to infer that the development of a range of work of the types detailed can be seen to represent overall progress in tackling occupational segregation, and that there have been positive changes in addressing this.

1.28 Although the actual impact of work of different types will have been varied, it is likely that the developments described in the report will have had an impact upon, for example: the overall context for tackling occupational segregation; the nature of policy and information; provision made and work undertaken; recognition and understanding of the issues; and the overall experiences of those affected by occupational segregation.

1.29 The report is in 7 sections. Sections 2 to 5 present the findings relating to the identification of progress in different types of work undertaken by public authorities. These cover developments to: structures, strategy and policy; information gathering, monitoring and reporting; initiatives and specific work; and training and awareness raising. Section 6 presents a discussion of factors viewed as enabling or constraining work to address occupational segregation, as well as views of work required in the future. Section 7 summarises the key findings by ministerial portfolios.

SECTION 2: STRUCTURES, STRATEGY AND POLICY

2.1   The overall structural arrangements through which public authorities work to tackle occupational segregation, along with related legislation, strategies and policies, set the context within which other developments and initiatives take place. These are important elements in enabling relevant issues to be addressed. It was recognised by many of those who participated in the research[7] that these factors could affect not only the processes and responsibilities for tackling occupational segregation, but also issues such as: the recognition and profile of this work; the overall way of addressing the issue within an organisation; and the likelihood of success or impact of work.

2.2   The legislative context was outlined in Section 1. This section presents the findings of the research relating to developments in structures, strategy and policy.

Organisational structures and modes of working

2.3   The research identified a number of relevant developments in relation to organisational structures at a national level and in specific public authorities[8] which were relevant to addressing occupational segregation.

2.4   At a national level, the Scottish Government's in-house evidence review identified the following structures as relevant to tackling the issue[9]:

- The Scottish Parliament Equal Opportunities Committee (a mandatory standing committee).
- The Scottish Government Equality Unit (established in 2000).
- The Concordat, agreed between the Scottish Government and the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (CoSLA) in 2007, and related Single Outcome Agreements (SOAs).
- The Women and Work Commission set-up by the United Kingdom (UK) Government in 2004.
- A Scottish Government Cross-Directorate Occupational Segregation Working Group (OSWG) which reported in 2008.
- The Close the Gap Partnership.
- A small think tank of influential women, which met in 2010 and produced a number of suggestions.

2.5   Among specific public authorities, occupational segregation issues were found to be addressed through one (or often both) of two main routes: the structures for dealing with and reporting upon equality issues; and the structures for dealing with and reporting on human resources (HR) issues. (This was borne out by case study discussions which often involved a representative covering each of these areas of

---

[7] Referred to throughout the report as "participants".

[8] Sometimes referred to subsequently simply as "authorities" or "organisations". To distinguish between public authorities and the specific sub-category of local authorities, the latter will always be referred to in full.

[9] The separate report by the Scottish Government (noted previously) provides further details of the findings of the evidence review, some of which are highlighted briefly in this report. References to supporting reports are also provided in the Scottish Government report.

work.) These types of arrangement were identified by most of the case study participants and were often (although not always) described in gender or single equality schemes[10], or in annual reports.

2.6   Although examples of developments to organisations' equality structures did not necessarily relate specifically to tackling occupational segregation, they were seen to be relevant to, and potentially to impact on this work. The most common forms of progress identified included:

- The establishment, continuation, or further development of a specific group, forum or committee with responsibility for equality and diversity issues (sometimes, although less commonly, with a specific focus on gender issues). In some public authorities these involved representatives from different parts of the organisation, or a specific geographical area. Some participants identified input to these groups from senior representatives of the organisation.
- The identification of a team, lead staff member, or point of contact with responsibility for equality or diversity issues, either through dedicated staff or as part of a wider role. In some cases, these staff were identified as having a specific remit to consider occupational segregation issues.

2.7   Examples of more specific structural arrangements through which occupational segregation issues were considered were identified in some organisations involved in the study. In almost all of these cases, this involved the formation of a specific group (or sub-group) for this purpose, and examples included:

- A working group or "think tank" to explore the experiences of women in a particular profession / organisation and suggest actions (e.g. individual organisation; local authority).
- A cross-directorate working group to explore the causes of occupational segregation and to make recommendations (individual organisation).
- A group to consider issues such as pay, structures, and benefits (e.g. individual organisation; local authority).
- A network to consider issues for carers and flexible working (local authority).
- A workforce planning group (or departmental monitoring groups) with a remit to examine or address occupational segregation (e.g. local authority).
- A group to oversee or monitor a specific positive action programme, initiative or project (e.g. local authority; higher and further education [HFE] institution).
- A forum or network to consider issues impacting on occupational segregation and develop work to address the issues, as well as, in some instances, working directly with women in the organisation (e.g. individual organisation; police).

---

[10] Sometimes referred to subsequently simply as "equality schemes" or "schemes".

2.8   Almost all of the case study participants believed that links had been made between work to tackle occupational segregation and wider equalities work. This was generally seen to take place through schemes, equality staff or leads, and the types of structural arrangements identified above. Examples of the development of such arrangements included:

- An Equality Officer having a role in both HR and wider equality issues.
- The development of action plans by separate departments or parts of an organisation, including the HR service.
- A staff member with responsibility for a scheme liaising with the HR service in the identification of relevant actions.
- HR staff attending equalities groups, and vice versa.

2.9   A number of case study participants also identified the role of HR staff and processes, given the importance of employment policy and practice in tackling occupational segregation. In some cases, staff with a specific remit for equality and diversity (or equality relating to employment) were located in the HR service (with this arrangement being identified by several police participants). There were also examples identified of "corporate" equalities staff (e.g. in some local authorities). Some participants from education services or HFE institutions also identified the role of staff and processes involved in planning and delivering subject choice or careers advice. Some local authorities identified a role for specific service departments, or HR staff within these departments.

Partnership working

2.10 Although most organisations in the study sample saw tackling occupational segregation largely as an internal workforce issue, a few examples were identified of developments in partnership working. This was most common in some HFE institutions, but examples in other types of organisations were also identified. More widely, there were examples of:

- Some organisations working with schools to try to encourage young people to consider a wide range of subject and career options (e.g. HFE; local authority).
- Organisations in the same sector working together to consider issues of common interest, to share information, develop training or initiatives, or to link into wider networks. For example, a number of police forces identified their involvement in a national "Women's Development Forum", with one describing the purpose of this being to support the personal and professional development of women and raise issues; while some local authorities and NHS boards identified links between HR staff to discuss common issues.
- Organisations working with private sector partners (e.g. local industry, such as construction) and using these links to try to address occupational segregation.
- National organisations supporting relevant local organisations to implement work (e.g. HFE; individual organisation).

- Multi-agency groups (e.g. often focused on wider equality or other issues) with a specific focus on issues relevant to occupational segregation.
- Project-based partnership working directly or indirectly relevant to this area of work, such as: a local authority working in partnership with a business school to promote women into management programmes; a range of organisations working together on an initiative relating to science, technology, engineering and maths; and partnership working on Curriculum for Excellence.
- Organisations working with specialist bodies such as "Close the Gap" or the Scottish Resource Centre for Women in Science, Engineering and Technology to take particular forms of work forward (e.g. HFE; individual organisation).

The identification of aims, objectives and commitments

2.11 There was also evidence of developments in the identification of aims, objectives and commitments at a national level and among some organisations in relation to tackling occupational segregation.

Key national aims, objectives and commitments

2.12 Key aims, objectives and commitments at a national level which were identified in the Scottish Government's in-house evidence review as being relevant to addressing occupational segregation were found to include:

- The Scottish Government's five strategic objectives (wealthier and fairer, smarter, healthier, safer and stronger, and greener).
- Fifteen national outcomes, including the following which were identified in the review as particularly relevant to tackling occupational segregation:
  - We have tackled the significant inequalities in Scottish society;
  - We realise our full economic potential with more and better employment opportunities for our people;
  - We are better educated, more skilled and more successful, renowned for our research and innovation;
  - Our young people are successful learners, confident individuals, effective contributors and responsible citizens;
  - Our children have the best start in life and are ready to succeed.
- The Scottish Government's overall commitment to promoting equality and to integrating equality into all aspects of its work (mainstreaming).
- The commitment to public sector reform.
- Relevant priorities and objectives contained within the specific frameworks, strategy and policy documents noted later.
- The identification of tackling occupational segregation as a ministerial priority in 2009.

Organisational aims, objectives and commitments

2.13 Examples of developments to organisational aims, objectives and commitments were also found in this research. The majority of case study participants believed that occupational segregation issues were reflected in their equality schemes. The document review also found that, in the largest number of organisations, an objective, aim or commitment to addressing relevant issues existed, although this was not the case in all. One local authority noted that, although occupational segregation was not referred to using the specific term, employment policy and practice were key elements of its scheme. Some other organisations also identified relevant, though non-specific objectives (reflecting again the close links between equality in employment practice and tackling occupational segregation).

2.14 The document review identified considerable evidence of objectives, aims or commitments at a broad level related to tackling equality or gender inequality, and, in some cases, to tackling these issues in relation to recruitment, training etc. However, there was also some evidence among a smaller number of authorities of objectives, aims or commitments focusing upon specific issues closely related to occupational segregation. These tended to focus on the following main areas, being to:

- Tackle occupational segregation overall.
- Tackle vertical segregation in the workforce and increase the number of women at senior levels; or tackle horizontal segregation in the workforce and address specific concentrations, or encourage non-traditional roles.
- Tackle, or continue to tackle the gender pay gap / promote equal pay (with such a commitment found in a considerable number of schemes or annual reports).
- Tackle occupational segregation in the community (e.g. improve the gender balance in subject choice at school, in HFE or in key sectors; tackle gender stereotyping; and encourage access to non-traditional courses, vocational training, work experience or Modern Apprenticeships).
- Investigate workforce or student gender balance and develop data collection.

2.15 Within these overall areas, there was also evidence of specific aims, objectives or commitments relating to the types of work which organisations intended to develop. Examples included: a commitment to developing or promoting relevant policies or options; addressing barriers in the culture of the organisation; raising awareness; using appropriate material; developing targeted programmes etc. (discussed further in Section 4). Some education authorities identified a commitment to addressing the attainment gap between boys and girls (which, although less directly relevant, is also linked). A number of HFE institutions noted they had (or intended to) become signatories to the Athena Swan Charter[11], which commits those involved to tackling the unequal representation of women in science through recognising and addressing barriers. A very small number of organisations identified targets relating to commitments made such as, for example: an increase in the

---

[11] http://www.athenaswan.org.uk/html/athena-swan/

number of women in management; improved gender balance in occupational groups; and the achievement of specific actions.

2.16 One police force noted that specific actions relating to tackling occupational segregation had been added to its action plan in response to the establishment of the ministerial priorities. Similarly, an NHS board noted that, while the issue had not been covered in a previous scheme, reference would be made in the new scheme then being drafted. Some authorities also provided further explanatory information about the nature of occupational segregation and the importance of tackling this (discussed further in Section 3).

2.17 With some exceptions, the main references to relevant aims, objectives and commitments to tackling occupational segregation were found within schemes and annual progress reports rather than, for example, in organisations' business plans, corporate plans etc. Where a relevant commitment was made in other documents, this was usually at a more general level and expressed in terms of promoting equality and/or diversity.

2.18 A very small number of examples were identified of the issue being referred to in other documents. While few local authority Single Outcome Agreements (SOAs) made reference to the need to tackle occupational segregation, one identified the need to address the gender pay gap in order to allow the area to reach its full economic potential and two identified the use of an indicator of the percentage of women among the highest 5% of earners under National Outcome 7[12]. One also identified an indicator of the delivery of single status in relation to National Outcome 15[13]. Requirements relating to procurement, where identified, tended to relate to the promotion of equality more generally. One local authority, in a policy document relating to a positive action programme, identified tackling occupational segregation issues among the specific objectives of this, but this was unusual.

2.19 Many equal pay policy statements highlighted the need to address this issue. Some examples were also identified of other workforce documents making reference to this.

Strategy and policy

2.20 The development of strategy and policy can also enable work to tackle occupational segregation. Some of the relevant documents at a national and international level identified in the Scottish Government's in-house evidence review were found to include:

- The United Nations Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW).
- The Scottish Government Equality Strategy.
- The National Performance Framework.
- The Scottish Government Economic Strategy.
- The public sector reform agenda.

---

[12] "We have tackled the significant inequalities in Scottish society".
[13] "Our public services are high quality, continually improving, efficient and responsive to local people's needs".

- The Scottish Government Strategy for Enterprise in Education and Skills for Work qualifications.
- The Scottish Government Skills Strategy.
- The Curriculum for Excellence.
- The Early Years Framework and Getting it Right for Every Child.
- The Scottish Government Childcare Strategy.

2.21 The review also identified a number of specific reports, policies reviews, recommendations and actions of relevance to work to tackle occupational segregation. Those identified included, for example: the report of the OSWG (2008); Workforce Plus; More Choices More Chances; Training for Work; 16+ Learning Choices; and a range of others detailed in the separate report of the evidence review.

2.22 Among specific public authorities in this research, the majority of participants in the case studies believed that there were relevant strategies or plans in place within which the issue of occupational segregation would be addressed. There were also references made to these strategies and plans in some (although relatively few) of the documents studied. Generally, these did not focus upon occupational segregation per se, but were of two main types: equality and diversity strategies; and workforce or HR strategies. This is consistent with findings presented earlier suggesting the perceived close links between tackling occupational segregation and other gender equality work, much of which is seen to relate to addressing workforce issues.

2.23 Examples were provided of the inclusion of the issue (or closely related issues such as equal pay) in both equality and diversity strategies, as well as in workforce plans or HR strategies. One case study participant, for example, stated that there was a "workforce" section in their organisation's equality and diversity strategy which presented information about occupational segregation. Other organisations also identified having equality or diversity plans for each department, or for different parts of the organisation.

2.24 One case study participant noted that work relating to tackling occupational segregation was tied closely to the organisation's workforce planning strategy which was addressing areas of shortage. Similarly, one local authority document identified that a key outcome of its workforce strategy was to have effective approaches which resulted in "tangible changes in traditional areas of occupational segregation". Another noted the development of workforce plans for all services, within which it was clearly specified that occupational segregation would be addressed. One NHS board single equality scheme identified the development of a plan to address gender issues in the workforce which included reference to part-time staff and the "gendered portrayal of health care jobs".

2.25 A small number of examples of a specific strategy or plan relating to occupational segregation were identified, as well as some examples of equal pay action plans. One local authority noted having a positive action programme to address the findings of an equal pay review, while another identified an intention to develop an action plan for specific groups where there was evidence of occupational segregation. One of the individual organisations identified a specific five year strategy relating to their sector's work with women and girls, much of which had been

incorporated subsequently to their scheme. A case study participant also noted that a specific action plan around women into management had been integrated to their scheme. One local authority participant stated that the organisation was intending to develop a specific strategy which would address occupational segregation. It was envisaged that this would cover not only their own employment practices but also work with other organisations.

2.26 Many examples were identified of the development of policies and practices seen to be relevant. While some had been in place for a considerable time, there was evidence of new developments. Most of the case study participants believed that they could identify progress or good practice in this area. Almost all of the case studies identified the existence of policies or employment options which would impact upon tackling occupational segregation (see paras 2.29, 2.30 and 2.31), and references to these were found in most organisations' documents. While these policies were not always identified in these terms, some were more direct, particularly in terms of tackling the proportion of women in senior positions. Most of the case study participants highlighted the need to recognise the role of these employment provisions.

2.27 Among the examples provided for the need for such work were references to the links between the disproportionate division of caring responsibilities for women and the need to promote options to develop employment provisions to overcome such barriers. A further example came from police, suggesting the use of workforce policies to tackle inflexibility and the long hours culture which can create barriers to progression. It was also noted, however (e.g. by one NHS board), that it was important to be aware of the need to avoid compounding stereotyping by suggesting that balancing work and home life was a woman's responsibility.

2.28 The most common policies or practices identified as impacting on tackling occupational segregation (although clearly the nature and level of provision varied) were:

- Flexible working policies, procedures and ways of working (with examples including part-time working; job sharing; flexitime; term time, compressed or annualised hours; career breaks; homeworking or teleworking; and in one case voluntarily reduced working time).
- Maternity, paternity and parental leave (and related policies such as: family leave; personal, domestic or adoption leave; care of dependents; carers' leave etc.).
- Equal pay policies and statements, and overall equality and diversity policies (often making reference to equal pay and addressing inequality).

2.29 Other policies identified included: recruitment and selection (as a means of reducing barriers and promoting equality); admissions (as a means of attracting a diverse pool of students); training and development (as a means of obtaining new skills or enabling progression); assessment and appraisal (as a means of promoting development); fair treatment at work (as a means of addressing barriers and promoting equality); uniforms (as a means of addressing barriers); and policies specific to particular specialist areas of work (as a means of enabling work in these fields). In some cases, it was noted that there was a commitment to particular forms

of provision, or an opportunity to apply, rather than mentioning a specific policy. One local authority noted that, in addition to formally agreed flexible working, there were a range of informal arrangements in place in the organisation's workplaces (e.g. flexible times and short term home working). One organisation also identified the framework for learning and teaching in Scotland as recognising the need to tackle stereotyping.

2.30 Some organisations made general reference to the provision of a suite of "work-life balance" or "family friendly" policies and practices, or suggested that they exceeded their legal obligations as an employer. Some also identified that new policies or practices had been developed, or existing provisions had been extended (e.g. with the advent of single status[14] in local authorities). There was also evidence in some cases that work had been carried out to promote or raise awareness of policies, sometimes with targeted groups, and this work is discussed further in relation to the development of initiatives and specific work (see Section 4).

Mainstreaming

2.31 At a national level, the evidence review noted that there is general work to ensure that all the equality duties are mainstreamed within the work of the Scottish Government. Among specific organisations in this research, most participants were able to identify perceived progress and developments towards mainstreaming work of relevance to tackling occupational segregation (although there were variations in perceptions of the extent of this, and a number of difficulties were identified which are considered in Section 6). Again, because of the perceived close links between occupational segregation and wider gender equality work, some of these participants made reference to developments in mainstreaming equality more generally, which they considered relevant. Similarly, the document review identified that many schemes or annual reports expressed a general commitment to mainstreaming, sometimes linked to a commitment to developing gender equality work beyond the requirements of the legislation.

2.32 The most common examples of evidence of mainstreaming were:

- The development of understanding and recognition of the issues (e.g. high level commitment; identification of responsibility; greater awareness and profile).
- Consideration of the issues through a mainstream structure (e.g. working groups; planning processes; programmes etc). One organisation stated that occupational segregation was a consideration in virtually all of its programmes.
- Consideration of the issues in the work of other services and inclusion in their mainstream strategic documents and materials (e.g. Career Box materials; community learning and development service plans; workforce plans or initiatives; Curriculum for Excellence; and others). A very small number of local authorities identified that occupational

---

[14] In 1999, an agreement was made between local authorities and trade unions that "single status" would be implemented, to involve harmonisation of the terms and conditions of former manual workers and Administration, Professional, Technical and Clerical (APT&C) workers, to include pay, working hours, annual leave, sick leave and negotiating mechanisms.

segregation was reflected in their Single Outcome Agreement. Examples were also given of trying to ensure that the issue was reflected in economic development and employability work.

- More general links between equalities work and other work (through, e.g. Equality Impact Assessments, action plans, training etc.). Some schemes identified a range of relevant documents and there was some evidence of a commitment to equality in other material (e.g. some council plans).

Summary of issues: structures, strategy and policy

2.33 In summary, the main points raised were as follows:

- Relevant national structures were identified. Additionally, among public authorities in this research, occupational segregation issues were found to be addressed largely through two main routes: equality structures and human resources (HR) structures.
- In some organisations, arrangements were found to be in place to consider occupational segregation directly.
- Links to other equalities work were made through equality schemes, networking by staff or shared reporting arrangements.
- The role of particular staff in addressing occupational segregation was identified in most organisations.
- Most work to address occupational segregation was found to be within public authorities, although examples of partnership working were also identified.
- There was evidence of developments in the identification of relevant aims, objectives and commitments at a national level and in specific organisations.
- Relevant national strategies and policies were identified. Among specific organisations a majority indicated that strategies or plans were in place to tackle occupational segregation, although these were largely wider strategies.
- Close links were identified in many organisations between tackling occupational segregation and workforce policies and practices, with examples of progress and developments to these.
- Most of the participants were able to identify perceived developments towards mainstreaming work of relevance to tackling occupational segregation.

SECTION 3: INFORMATION GATHERING, MONITORING AND REPORTING

3.1   A further key element in addressing occupational segregation is identifying the nature and extent of the issue and assessing change, both of which require mechanisms for information gathering, monitoring and reporting.

3.2   This section presents the findings relating to progress and developments in information gathering, monitoring and reporting, as well as identifying some examples of how the information has been used (e.g. to evidence changes to employment patterns, and other uses). While it would impossible to identify the specific uses made of the material in each case, it was often implicit that these developments would assist in identifying the way forward and informing developments. There were many specific examples of the contribution of information gathering, monitoring and reporting to actions, including: the development of documents (e.g. schemes and strategies); the development of understanding of the nature and extent of aspects of occupational segregation; and the development of targeted and other work. Specific examples relating to the reporting and use of information are provided at the end of the section.

Information gathering and monitoring

3.3   The Scottish Government's in-house evidence review, as well as the document review and case studies in this research identified developments to information gathering and monitoring in many of the organisations involved, with a large number of schemes and annual reports and almost all of the case study participants identifying such work.

3.4   The Scottish Government's evidence review identified a commitment to evidence-based policy making, with developments to gathering and making use of information at corporate level and across all Government directorates. The review highlighted national work to ensure that the equality dimensions of the indicators, outcomes and targets of the Government's National Performance Framework were developed, monitored and delivered in an evidence-based way. It also identified work to develop an Equalities Measurement Framework and to progress other recommendations made as part of the Office for National Statistics (ONS) led Equalities Data Review.

Statistical data

3.5   The evidence review identified relevant national statistical data noting, for example, the provision and use of statistics on: school education in Scotland (including pupil and teacher information and attainment and qualification results and statistics on the destinations of school leavers); lifelong learning (post-compulsory education); and labour market (e.g. employment, unemployment, economic inactivity, earnings, and public sector employment).

3.6   Among specific organisations in the document review and case studies, most of the schemes examined made reference to the <u>nature</u> of information being collected relevant to occupational segregation issues. The most common was the make-up of the workforce by gender (sometimes including references to collecting additional

material such as grades, pay scales, hours and types of work). A further issue identified frequently was the collection (or a commitment to the collection) of information by gender relating to recruitment and selection (sometimes including applications), and training (again sometimes including applications). Several also identified undertaking a regular review or audit of equal pay. Examples were identified of organisations of various types undertaking a regular audit of staff, or an annual monitoring exercise. One case study interviewee identified a "best value" review of diversity, within which the staff numbers and roles had been examined.

3.7   Smaller numbers made reference to the collection of statistical information by gender relating to: promotion; turnover and retention; types of contract; access to (or requests for) flexible working or family friendly provision (including the use of childcare vouchers); maternity leave and returners; caring responsibilities; subject or vocational choices (including Modern Apprenticeships); numbers of students, attainment and destinations. One NHS board carried out an extensive statistical analysis of working patterns.

Qualitative information

3.8   In addition to statistical information, there was some evidence of the collection of information through consultation, involvement or engagement. The Scottish Government's evidence review identified work undertaken to develop good practice in consultation. It also identified that there have been a number of relevant consultation exercises on equalities issues and on some specific issues relevant to occupational segregation (e.g. early years and childcare; Modern Apprenticeships; and national qualifications). Among specific organisations, the focus of consultation, involvement or engagement was often found to have been on equalities issues generally (e.g. relating to the preparation of a scheme). There were also examples, however, of some work with a more specific focus on issues relevant to occupational segregation. A range of methods were identified as being used with staff, community members and other stakeholders, including focus groups, surveys, on-line materials and other techniques. Over half of the case study participants identified progress or perceived good practice relating to such work.

3.9   There were some examples of consultation with specific groups (often groups of women) to explore views of particular issues. Examples included: an HFE institution which conducted interviews with learners who were in a minority because of their gender; organisations conducting focus groups with women at different levels; a local authority carrying out focus groups with young people about their choices; an HFE organisation exploring the views of senior women; a local authority involving a local women's organisation; organisations consulting with organisations with expertise on these issues; and examples of other specific meetings with interested women. Some participants also identified work to engage with men relating to these issues.

3.10 In some cases, it was identified that relevant issues had been explored specifically through engagement with community members or staff, while in others, relevant issues had been raised by participants. One local authority, for example, noted that "extensive consultations with community groups" had led to the identification of the gender pay gap and occupational segregation as themes. There were a number of other examples of these issues emerging as themes or issues of

concern to participants in consultation processes. It was also noted by some organisations (particularly local authorities) that the development of all new employment policies and procedures (including equal pay issues) involved consultation in some form with employees, trades unions and services.

3.11 Examples were also noted of the identification of more specific issues, such as perceptions of flexible working and other employment provisions and the use of these; approaches to, and treatment of men and women; perceptions of access to, and barriers in promotion, training and career development; issues in subject choice; as well as particular barriers in specific organisations, parts of organisations, or wider society.

3.12 A small number of examples were identified of the collection of information through evaluation, particularly of specific initiatives, although the level of detail, and the formality of the processes, varied. The Scottish Government's evidence review identified that there have been evaluations of some national work and initiatives which have informed subsequent developments. One specific organisation also identified a detailed evaluation framework for a national positive action programme. There were also a small number of examples of local authorities carrying out evaluations of positive action programmes. There was also evidence of less systematic, more anecdotal evaluation.

Equality Impact Assessments

3.13 A further potential means of highlighting issues and providing information on occupational segregation was through the use of Equality Impact Assessments (EQIAs). The document review identified evidence of many EQIAs being undertaken on employment-related policies and procedures to explore their impact on equality overall (or upon gender equality). Some highlighted developments to the EQIA processes or to the provision of training to those undertaking these.

3.14 However, the specific use of EQIAs to highlight occupational segregation per se was found to be limited. A number of case study participants suggested that they were unaware of the use of EQIAs for this purpose. It was noted by some, however, that EQIAs in areas such as equal pay and grading, HR policies, recruitment, and, in some cases, specific projects, were relevant, and had led to changes to policy or practice which would impact on tackling occupational segregation, even if this was not made explicit.

3.15 Among the limited examples provided of the use of EQIAs to link directly to occupational segregation, these related to the examination of:

- A leisure service, which identified a lack of women to provide coaching.
- Parking issues, which identified an impact on women and low paid people.
- A specific work initiative to target those furthest from the jobs market which identified the positive impact of the provision of support to people in employment and the avoidance of "clustering" of women in low paid jobs, thus making a contribution to narrowing the gender pay gap.
- A specific project, highlighted in the Scottish Government's evidence review, for which the EQIA found evidence of gender stereotyping in

recruitment and selection of Skills for Work courses (with the identification of action such as tasters, events at job fairs, and other action to address this).

- A mental health service which identified a lack of males working with young people.
- A promotion and selection policy which showed additional barriers for women when considering applying for promotion (although these were not found to be linked to the policy being examined).
- Provision of equipment and clothing, which identified that this was not always suitable for women and would impact on the work they could undertake (with some action to address this identified).
- Subject choice, in the context of admissions to an HFE institution.

3.16 A number of case study participants identified the potential for the greater use of EQIAs to make specific links to occupational segregation.

Presentation, analysis and use of data

3.17 It was found that there was considerable variation not only in the nature and extent of data collected, but also in the extent of interpretation and analysis undertaken, the ways in which it was presented (e.g. whether or not direct links were made to occupational segregation), and the uses made of this.

3.18 The most common data presented in equality schemes and annual reports was found to be statistical workforce or student information by gender (reflecting the pattern of data collection). For some, this was a straightforward presentation of the numbers of women and men, with no analysis. In some cases, there was a further breakdown, for example, by grade or by part of the organisation (e.g. individual services). A number of local authorities provided specific information about the proportion of women in the top 2% and 5% of earners (reflecting the existence of this as a statutory performance indicator). Some organisations also provided data relating to patterns of applications, pay scales, and patterns of working or attendance at courses, although this was relatively unusual. There were also some examples of presentation of data about Modern Apprenticeships or subject choice and attainment. One HFE institution and a small number of local authorities provided very detailed local contextual information and some provided statistical appendices to schemes or annual reports. Some made reference to specific workforce monitoring reports (discussed later).

3.19 There were some examples in schemes and annual reports, or in subject specific reports, of the presentation of information from consultation, involvement or engagement processes, For example, one local authority identified the preparation of a "women into management" paper with a summary of the views of women employees and their recommendations, with the suggestion that this material informed continuous improvement.

3.20 While some organisations simply presented statistical (or other) data in schemes and annual reports, many provided further analysis of the nature and extent of occupational segregation. Some identified the existence of occupational segregation nationally or locally (e.g. within their own organisation). This included references to, for example, the under-representation of women in senior posts, and

the concentration of women and men in particular types of work, subject areas, services and vocational areas, in some cases with supporting statistical information. One example highlighted the under-representation of ethnic minority women in senior positions in the public sector in Scotland. Some linked occupational segregation specifically to the gender pay gap or provided evidence of the gender pay gap (nationally or locally).

3.21 Both the document review and case studies provided evidence of perceived changes to employment patterns. Several organisations used information gathered to indicate positive findings, or improvements, particularly in relation to vertical (but also sometimes horizontal) segregation in their own organisations. Examples included:

- Several organisations identified a good representation of women in senior and middle management, or improvements to this (with examples from organisations of different types, particularly local authorities and HFE institutions). A small number of local authorities also highlighted an increase in the number of women as head or deputy head teachers in secondary schools. It was also suggested that there had been an increase both in the overall number of women police officers, and in the number of women in promoted police posts between 2003 and 2008.
- Some organisations identified evidence of improvements to horizontal segregation in workplaces. Among police forces, this tended to be in terms of an increase in the overall recruitment of women as police officers, although some provided examples of an increased number of women in traditionally male-dominated specialist functions such as search and rescue, road policing or firearms. There were also a small number of examples from local authorities of increases in men working in childcare roles or in home care, and of women working in non-traditional areas (such as one female team of land services operatives).
- Some organisations noted changes to occupational segregation in subject choice, courses and vocational training. Some colleges highlighted improvements in the level of involvement of women and men in non-traditional courses. There were also examples of increases in the number of apprenticeships, Skillseekers and work experience placements in non-traditional areas. A small number of education authorities also noted some improvements to segregation in subjects studied, and one described "some significant change towards trying non-traditional subjects".
- A number of comments were made relating to improvements to equal pay, and a number also noted positive findings from equal pay audits or analyses. Some case study participants also suggested that there had been increases in the number of staff using flexible means of working.

3.22 In some cases, these changes were seen to be linked to specific work which had been undertaken. One local authority, for example, commented on the "significant improvement" in the gender pay gap as a result of the implementation of single status, with a narrowing of this for full-time employees. One outlined that a number of women had applied for senior posts following a specific development

programme. Some organisations also identified work undertaken to encourage girls and women (or boys and men) into non-traditional areas, or to challenge stereotyping in schools, as having contributed to changing patterns. The impact of some specific employment initiatives was also noted (e.g. targeted recruitment; projects working with a particular gender; and other positive action). A small number of participants also identified the potential impact of other factors, such as broader restructuring in an organisation, which had led to opportunities at a senior level.

3.23 Alongside examples of progress, there was also considerable evidence of a recognition of the need for continuing action, as well as the use of evidence to demonstrate this. For example, some presented additional data or information to support this view, including using this to identify specific problems such as: a continuing high proportion of women in lower grades; a low proportion of women in middle management; continuing horizontal segregation in specific types of work or in subjects studied at school, college and university; and vocational choices. There were many areas identified in which horizontal segregation was a particular issue, including, for example: specialist police roles; construction; maintenance; trades; engineering; nursing and care; beauty; administration etc. Difficulties were also highlighted in: retention where women studied male-dominated subjects; remaining issues with equal pay; remaining differences in working patterns; and general slow or "mixed" progress.

3.24 Some organisations compared information relating to their own organisation either to that of similar organisations in different parts of Scotland, or to the pattern nationally (not always favourably). A number suggested that the position in their own organisation reflected wider trends in society. Some also provided further explanation for patterns, suggesting that they had, in some cases, taken steps to explore the causes in more detail and to identify any potential discrimination. The information provided also highlighted some perceived difficulties that they could face in addressing these issues (discussed further in Section 6).

Reporting and the use of the information

3.25 A wide variety of means of reporting (particularly of statistical information) were identified, perhaps reflecting the range of reporting structures involved (see Section 2). The Scottish Government's in-house evidence review identified examples of publications with relevant statistics relating, for example, to school education in Scotland, lifelong learning, labour market information etc. Such material has been used to inform the identification of occupational segregation issues.

3.26 Among specific organisations, the document review illustrated that a number presented at least some information as part of their annual reporting on their schemes. Some organisations (of different types) also noted the preparation of a specific annual or regular report on workforce issues, or on issues directly relevant to occupational segregation (e.g. the success or progression of students by gender). One local authority noted that it had realigned the timing of its reporting processes to allow these to feed into reporting progress on the scheme.

3.27 An example was identified of one individual organisation which prepared an annual report on participation across its sector, and there was also evidence of the compilation and publication of information from other organisations in specific

sectors. One police participant noted providing information in quarterly equality and diversity reports. A small number of organisations also noted a commitment to improved reporting, or made general comments on the value of this.

3.28 In addition to reporting, other examples of the uses of data to increase understanding, promote change or identify the need for action included:

- The review, audit or analysis of material and identification of issues. One HFE institution, for example, conducted an annual review of information and another carried out a session-end review, drawing upon statistical information relating to students. A number of participants made reference to reviewing equal pay statements or issues.
- Further investigation or research. One local authority, for example, conducted gender workshops to examine the potential reasons for an identified employment pattern.
- The provision of management information, including circulation to management teams, relevant groups or committees. One local authority identified that a member of staff from HR met with all departmental HR managers to provide a presentation of the corporate analysis and to encourage them to consider occupational segregation issues. Examples of committees and groups taking an overview of progress were also provided.
- The identification of actions (with examples from organisations of a range of types). One local authority provided workforce data to each separate service, with individual workforce and recruitment profiles prepared by equality strand. One HFE participant noted that their organisation was trying to increase awareness and ownership by asking departments a series of "challenge questions" as a way of responding to the data. A number of organisations identified using consultation findings to inform the development of their schemes, actions and / or priorities.
- Contribution to overall equality monitoring and benchmarking, as well as the provision of data to inform national statistics in some sectors (e.g. through the statutory performance indicator monitoring process).
- Wider dissemination of information, feedback and follow-up. One police force, for example, noted that updates were provided to divisions. There were also examples of the publication of information in a range of places (e.g. newsletters; intranet; websites etc.). One HFE institution noted that it provided letters to students to advise them of the actions taken to address issues raised in consultation.

3.29 A small number of examples were found in the document review of organisations stressing the importance of their own responsibility in tackling occupational segregation, their leadership role, or the general benefits of monitoring information to inform processes. Several made a commitment to continuing, or improving information collection.

Further improvements to information collection, analysis and reporting

3.30 A number of organisations highlighted further changes or improvements to their practice (undertaken or planned) in relation to information collection, analysis, reporting and use of information. These included:

- The collection (or planned collection) of improved or new statistical data on a range of issues, the most common being flexible working, but also including: recruitment and promotion; applications; training; progression; retention; working hours; grades; work placements; subject choices; and a range of other issues. One local authority identified the development of a process to gather statistics relating to the long hours culture. The Scottish Government's evidence review identified that, nationally, a core set of socio-economic questions has been introduced for use in surveys, one of which is gender.
- The collection of additional qualitative information or completion of additional consultation, involvement or engagement work. This included, for example, reviewing the content of surveys to ensure coverage of relevant issues. One local authority identified using a new survey as a way of providing information to staff (e.g. about issues such as positive action) as well as collecting information. Another organisation identified the development of a network of relevant stakeholders which would be involved in future consultation. One local authority identified an action to encourage the involvement of men in discussing concerns traditionally seen as "women's issues" including the gender pay gap.
- Development of the means of data collection or infrastructure, with a number of examples of new HR information systems or means of recording. One NHS board, for example, identified the use of new monitoring systems, while a number of police made reference to a new HR database. Some education authorities made reference to the SEEMIS system for pupil information.
- Improved or increased data analysis. One local authority, for example, identified an action in their scheme to adopt a more sophisticated approach to data analysis. One local authority had developed a "workforce profiling questionnaire" which was completed by services and analysed to develop a workforce profiling and planning toolkit.
- Development of targets, performance frameworks or requirements placed on contractors. One participant identified the development of a performance framework focusing on the representation of women in specific posts. Another identified placing more robust requirements upon funded organisations.
- Increases in the number of reports presented to boards, management groups or senior management.
- Developments or improvements to the EQIA processes.

3.31 One police participant, in summarising their view of developments to information gathering, monitoring and reporting stated that there had been "massive developments in this area". This view was shared by a number of other participants from other types of organisations who suggested that there had been significant

improvements to this aspect of work to tackle occupational segregation in recent years.

Summary of issues: information gathering, monitoring and reporting

3.32 In summary, the main points raised were as follows:

- The research identified developments to information gathering, monitoring and reporting at a national level and in many specific organisations.
- Relevant national statistics were identified and many specific organisations made reference to gathering information pertinent to addressing occupational segregation, largely data on the make-up of their workforce by gender.
- In addition to statistical information, there was some evidence of the collection of relevant information through consultation, involvement or engagement, using a range of methods. A small number of examples were identified of the collection of information through evaluation.
- A substantial number of Equality Impact Assessments (EQIAs) were found to have been undertaken on employment-related policies although fewer had a direct focus on occupational segregation.
- There was considerable variation in the extent to which information gathered was analysed, interpreted and presented.
- The most common data presented in equality schemes and annual reports was statistical workforce or student information by gender.
- Both the document review and case studies provided evidence of perceived changes to employment patterns and several organisations indicated positive findings or improvements.
- A variety of means of reporting (particularly of statistics) were identified.
- Several organisations made a commitment to continuing, or improving information collection.

SECTION 4: INITIATIVES AND SPECIFIC WORK

4.1   As well as exploring progress in developing the overall context for work to address occupational segregation, the research also explored some of the specific work taking place. This fell broadly into two overlapping areas: the development of initiatives; and the development of training and awareness raising. The next two sections examine progress in each of these broad areas, although it is recognised that there was not always a clear distinction between them: some "initiatives", for example, involved the provision of training; while some awareness raising could be seen as an "initiative". The two sections, taken together, provide an overview of the findings in relation to work taking place in public authorities to address occupational segregation. This section deals with initiatives and specific work.

4.2   Many examples were provided of initiatives and specific work to address occupational segregation, although there was variation in the extent and nature of this work between organisations. Documentary evidence suggested that the majority (although not all) of the organisations were carrying out at least some work of this nature. A number of organisations identified the need for such initiatives and specific work to address occupational segregation. The ways in which such work could have an impact on tackling this, through raising and addressing the issues both at group and individual level, and enabling change were also highlighted.

4.3   Almost all of the case study participants identified what they perceived to be examples of progress or good practice in these types of work. The main types of work identified included:

- Overall positive action programmes and employment initiatives.
- Measures to recruit and encourage entry to non-traditional areas.
- Support to individuals.
- Research and funding work.

Overall positive action programmes and employment initiatives

4.4   Some examples were identified both in the Scottish Government's evidence review and in this research of relevant positive action programmes and initiatives. At a national level, the Scottish Government's evidence review identified the provision of support to a range of programmes and projects relevant to tackling occupational segregation.

4.5   Within this research, there were some examples of large scale positive action programmes to tackle occupational segregation. One local authority, for example, developed such a programme in response to the equal pay review to address barriers to career progression and gender imbalance. There were a number of different elements within this, including provision of: opportunity for career discussions; identification of skills required for placement in a non-traditional area of work; assistance to develop competence through activities such as taster days, job-shadowing, pilot projects, council programmes and other learning; and assistance in applying for posts. Another noted work to develop an holistic organisational approach to occupational segregation which would include practical measures to address occupational segregation in key service areas and work with other organisations, within an overall co-ordinated approach.

4.6 There were also some examples of positive action programmes or pilots to encourage and enable under-represented groups to enter specific sectors. An individual organisation identified a programme which was running across a number of local areas to develop women's involvement and progression in sport coaching. There were examples of work in, for example, local authority or HFE settings to encourage women into construction, and some examples were provided of successes in this (e.g. a local authority identified that they were starting to see women in construction trades, while a college noted having women lecturers now involved in delivering teaching in construction. Another identified an increase in women taking part in construction courses.) One local authority identified the development of an all female refuse squad, which had led to work to involve women in another male-dominated area of the fleet (PSV licences).

4.7 The Scottish Government's evidence review highlighted a national drive to raise the status of the early years and childcare workforce, with work on childcare standards, qualifications and career development. It also noted activities to attract men and other under-represented groups into the early years and childcare sector. A number of local authorities (and some other participants) also identified positive action projects to increase the number of men in early years and childcare, and again there were a number of examples of some successes in this (e.g. one local authority reported some males who achieved Scottish Vocational Qualifications (SVQs); another identified a pilot project which led to men working with mobile crèches, playgroups and out of school clubs, with the creation of a bank of male childcare workers; and some colleges noted increases in males in childcare as a result, they believed of positive action). There were also examples of positive action work with, or links to, specific industry or sector bodies, forums or organisations (e.g. a college working with partners in the construction sector) to identify ways of increasing the role of under-represented groups in a particular sector, or to develop or provide access to support.

4.8 Examples were also identified of positive action work to encourage and enable women into management and senior posts. A small number of local authorities, for example, described initiatives of this kind, while an NHS board identified Scottish level work to address this issue.

4.9 Some organisations also identified the relevance of wider employment programmes and economic or regeneration initiatives, even where their purpose may not be identified specifically as tackling occupational segregation. Some, for example, identified the relevance of "into work" initiatives targeting women or other relevant groups (such as lone parents, low paid people or ethnic minority women). One local authority noted, for example, that a women's employability project had enabled a number of women to re-evaluate their career options and to consider further learning, with the development of personalised plans. Another noted employability work targeting lone parents which had involved the identification of barriers and the provision of tailored support. Similarly, the Scottish Government's evidence review noted positive findings from the evaluation of the Working for Families Fund in terms of outcomes relating to employability for participants.

4.10 A number of participants also identified the relevance of work undertaken through: Modern Apprenticeships; Skillseekers; vocational training; as well as forms of supported employment, or access to employment. A number of participants noted

the promotion and use of apprenticeships in non-traditional areas. Other specific programmes targeting young people were also highlighted, including a programme to promote choices and chances for young people in applied science and technology; a "Get Ready for Work" programme which aimed to encourage employment opportunities for young women to apply for jobs where the workforce is predominantly male; and the STEM[15] programme which has been undertaking work to influence the choices made by young people in science, technology, engineering and maths. The Scottish Government's evidence review also identified that much work has been undertaken to develop skills for learning, life and work through initiatives such as Determined to Succeed and Skills for Work qualifications (with some positive findings from evaluations, although gender issues were also identified).

4.11 Some of the initiatives identified above involved training elements, and these aspects are discussed further in Section 5.

Measures to recruit and encourage entry to non-traditional areas

4.12 While there were relatively few examples of large scale overarching positive action programmes and initiatives, there were many more examples of specific forms of work undertaken either as part of these wider initiatives, or in many cases on a stand-alone basis to recruit and encourage people to consider, or enter non-traditional employment areas.

Work to challenge stereotypes and promote awareness of opportunities

4.13 There were many examples of work undertaken to promote awareness of opportunities for work in non-traditional areas, or progression. The Scottish Government's evidence review, for example, highlighted specific work by Children in Scotland to address barriers and challenge gender stereotypes, while many specific organisations stated that they were seeking to promote an appropriate message, consistent with challenging occupational segregation. Many organisations also identified specific relevant work with children and young people.

4.14 Examples were identified of developments in advertising and recruitment processes, and some organisations reported perceived successes through such work. These included general work to develop appropriate advertising, with a number of examples of organisations considering their advertising process overall, or the materials used. Some examples were provided of specific changes made, for example, to the language used. One organisation, for example, reported that changes to terminology and to the location of advertising had made some difference to promoting gender equality. One police participant noted that the force was trying to move to a position where all posts would be advertised as suitable for part-time work by default. A local authority identified that a recruitment toolkit had been developed containing advice for use in the consideration of a post (e.g. whether it could be part-time, what requirements there may be, advertising etc.). Those using the material would also be directed to other guidance on specific issues.

---

[15] http://www.stemscotland.com

4.15 There were also examples of the use of advertising which avoided stereotyping, or the use of positive action statements to welcome applications from under-represented groups. One police force noted updating its recruitment website to make a specific appeal to under-represented groups. There were also examples of organisations considering a wider range of locations for their advertising.

4.16 Some examples were identified of targeted advertising aimed at a recruiting a particular group (often women or men, and including, in one case, ethnic minority women) to employment or courses. This sometimes followed the identification of specific areas of under-representation of a particular gender. Some participants outlined that they undertook this type of work (e.g. some local authorities, police and HFE institutions), while others provided more specific examples, such as targeting women into construction or other trade sectors. As noted previously, there were some examples of perceived successes in this. There were also examples of work targeting men into home care and men into early years and childcare work (including, for example, large scale promotion and publicity using appropriate language, and targeting specific groups of men and boys) with, again, some evidence of success. Some of these initiatives were linked to national work (e.g. work to promote men into childcare).

4.17 More widely, there were examples from many organisations of work involving other forms of marketing, and other types of material. As with advertising, a key focus was on the use of images, marketing materials and methods presenting appropriate and non-stereotypical messages relating to gender. This included messages in publicity material and publications, as well as on websites. The Scottish Government's evidence review, for example, noted that the Scottish Government wrote to colleges, the SQA and the Scottish Funding Council in 2009 to invite them to provide an update on any activity being undertaken to resolve gender imbalances, and feedback suggested substantial good practice on ensuring that marketing materials and other initiatives promoted opportunities for students to consider and take up non-traditional subjects (with examples given in the evidence review report).

4.18 A local authority identified the development of promotional materials to positively promote the message that there are "no subjects for boys and no subjects for girls". The Scottish Government's evidence review, along with an individual organisation, identified a specific marketing campaign highlighting a range of science careers, with a key aim of tackling the perception that science is "just for boys". It was also noted that Close the Gap (an organisation which receives public authority funding) was developing materials for a campaign with 11-14 year olds, teachers and parents to raise awareness of non-stereotypical career choices. One HFE institution identified developing posters depicting older people as students, as a way of attracting older women into science.

4.19 Examples were also identified of the development of appropriate learning and teaching materials, including work to ensure that the general content of the curriculum in school and higher and further education did not include or promote gender stereotyping. A number of education authorities and HFE institutions suggested that there had been improvements in this area. A number of organisations also identified that materials used were more rigorously scrutinised to identify and so avoid any potential issues. The use of specific materials to raise issues relating to occupational segregation is discussed further in Section 5.

4.20 Some organisations identified the use of different types of events, roadshows and awareness days to promote a positive message. One police force identified a "diversity recruiting team" which had undertaken work through events and initiatives with under-represented groups. Another identified considering how to provide a gender balanced presence at careers events. A number of forces noted that awareness days were run as part of the recruitment process for some specialist posts to provide an opportunity to find out more about a role. One local authority identified holding specific awareness days to promote entry to non-traditional areas of work. An HFE institution noted that its early education team targeted school / college information events to promote early years courses to boys, while a local authority gave an example of a "women in property" conference targeted at S5 and S6 to increase awareness of employment opportunities. A police force identified having undertaken events aimed at ethnic minority women, while another identified having held focus groups to explore "truth and myths" about particular specialist roles.

4.21 There were also examples of the provision of taster sessions, secondments and job-shadowing opportunities. One police force, for example, identified offering short term secondments to a particular specialism within which women were under-represented. A small number of local authorities identified awareness sessions on trying non-traditional subjects (e.g. in partnership either with private sector organisations or HFE organisations) and a number of HFE institutions identified offering taster opportunities. One local authority identified a programme of tasters in non-traditional occupations for primary school pupils at a local college. One HFE institution identified working with local authorities to promote non-traditional courses for school pupils attending as part of their link programme. Although difficult to identify the impact of such work, some participants suggested that it had provided insight into opportunities available in non-traditional areas of work, whether or not those involved had subsequently pursued these. Additionally, one local authority suggested that, following tasters for S2 pupils, statistics about students' subject choices had shown an increase in their trying non-traditional subjects.

4.22 Some organisations identified the use of work placements and work experience programmes. There was evidence, for example, of some organisations considering the promotion of work placement opportunities in areas where there was a gender imbalance. One local authority reported an increase in the uptake of non-traditional work placements. Some local authorities also highlighted encouraging pupils to try a wide range of options for work experience placements in non-traditional roles and some mentioned specifically the promotion of non-traditional options in Modern Apprenticeships. Again, some examples of successes were provided. Other methods identified included the use of particular learning opportunities. One local authority, for example, noted that an entry by young people to an equality competition had addressed the issue of subject choice.

4.23 There were many examples of the use of role models and case studies (often, but not exclusively, with young people). A number of HFE institutions, for example, identified this type of work both for staff and students. Some organisations (of a range of types) also highlighted providing speakers to schools who might represent role models, or the use of specific case studies to highlight successes in non-traditional areas (including providing examples on a website). One local authority

identified using a case study of a woman in a non-traditional trade who had won an award as an apprentice as a way of encouraging other young women into male-dominated areas. Another identified introducing non-traditional role models (such as women firefighters). A small number of participants mentioned the use of STEM ambassadors (see above). Again, some participants suggested that such work had been useful in identifying opportunities for non-traditional work.

4.24 The use of incentives was also cited by one local authority, where payment had been used to try to encourage young people to make non-stereotypical choices in vocational training. The organisation involved stated that young women had been more inclined to take up this option than young men, with young women perceived to be more willing to take a "risk" in this way.

4.25 There were also many examples of the development of general work with (or in) schools. One organisation was considering the delivery of messages through YouTube and social networking sites, in order to "future proof" delivery. A small number of organisations identified the use of the press and television (internal or community) to promote particular issues.

Recruitment processes and procedures

4.26 Many references were identified to organisations following good equalities practice in recruitment processes and procedures, and this was widely seen to impact upon tackling occupational segregation. One local authority, for example, noted the overall modernisation of its approach to recruitment and retention, while another noted considering the more specific process of recruitment to apprenticeships to ensure equality.

4.27 An HFE institution noted reviewing HR procedures to encourage applications from under-represented groups, while others had considered their approach to admissions. One noted amending its application form to help address the small number of male applicants to a childcare course. It was also noted that, for a period from 2005, a number of HFE organisations worked together with others to develop good practice to support women and men to enrol on and pursue non-traditional courses.

4.28 A small number of other organisations identified the use of a range of different recruitment techniques, such as telephone or online applications, practical tests etc. One police force identified the removal of a formal request process in relation to specialisms (where women are under-represented) and a move to an "open door" policy. One individual organisation noted the involvement of relevant gender organisations in recruitment. One local authority identified providing guaranteed interviews for participants involved in a positive action programme and where they met minimum criteria. A small number of organisations identified targeting ethnic minority people in recruitment. In this context, one local authority noted having held a recruitment drop-in surgery for ethnic minority women.

Support to individuals

4.29 There were also a number of examples of the provision of support to individuals, to enable them to work in non-traditional occupations, or to enable their progression.

Mentoring

4.30 Almost half of the case study organisations of various types mentioned mentoring initiatives, with others considering their use. Some of these initiatives were part of wider employment or positive action programmes, while others were specific to organisations. Some were long-standing, and one local authority identified having a 5th cohort of their scheme. There were also some initiatives at a pilot stage. In one area, an example was provided of a programme to develop a pool of public sector mentors. A number of police participants identified an initiative beginning in April 2010 to develop a pilot cross-force mentoring programme involving four forces (with some other forces continuing with internal provision during the pilot). A small number of individual organisations noted the provision of a business mentoring service. One local authority also identified a high level of informal mentoring taking place.

4.31 Some, although not all of these initiatives were aimed specifically at women employees. One local authority identified that a small number of senior women had participated in a pilot where an external organisation provided mentoring to support the influence of gender at senior decision making level. It was identified that direct informal feedback from participants suggested that this had been useful. One local authority identified work to develop mentoring arrangements for ethnic minority women. Where programmes were not gender-specific, a number of participants noted a high level of take-up by women.

4.32 There was also evidence of the provision of mentoring as part of wider initiatives. The Scottish Government's evidence review, for example, noted the provision of support to Men in Childcare, which provided mentoring support (as well as training opportunities) to men to gain employment in the sector.

Support, advice and networks

4.33 A small number of examples of the development of specific support and advice were highlighted, although some organisations suggested that opportunities for this existed for all staff through existing HR processes (discussed further in Section 5). A variety of relevant support networks or forums within or between organisations were identified often of, and for women staff. Examples included: a senior women's network; a women's career development network; a women in management group (e.g. individual organisation; HFE institution; local authority); general women employees' groups or associations (e.g. police; local authority); support groups for female students or students on courses which were previously gender-specific; networks for women in employment sectors particularly affected by horizontal segregation (e.g. individual organisations; HFE institutions); national networks, sometimes with links to local organisations; and support groups for women involved in employment initiatives in the community. One local authority also provided an example of work to develop a carers' and flexible working employee network.

4.34 The role of such networks varied between organisations, but their perceived objectives and benefits were seen to include: opportunities for professional and social contacts and links; promotion of gender equality work; prevention of isolation; information sharing; research and identification of relevant issues; promotion of actions; and the development of training and events. Some organisations identified that they would actively promote membership of a network and / or its related events. The role of women in developing these organisations was outlined in some cases, and one HFE institution provided a detailed example of the involvement of a group of female students within traditionally male areas of study, with evidence of successes in raising the profile of the network, developing the organisation and facilitating events. Some participants were also clear about the role of such bodies in positive action, and the need for women-only provision. One body, however, had started as a women's organisation but now had membership and events open to both women and men. This approach was based upon a perceived need to engage men with these issues, to address male attitudes, and to involve them in the work which develops.

Other personal support

4.35 Whilst a number of networks were identified, a less common example of peer support was through the establishment of single gender teams in a particular role. An example was found in a local authority of an all-women team which enabled participants to support each other. A small number of examples of computer clubs for girls in schools were also highlighted. One local authority identified that a number of schools had been involved in work to run such clubs, with the aim of addressing the gender imbalance in the IT industry.

4.36 Other forms of support identified included the development of "buddy" systems (in one case for students, and in two cases for staff) and the provision of peer support to women in business. One individual organisation noted having assisted ethnic minority people in this context. There were also a small number of examples of the provision of support and information to carers. One local authority, as part of a wider positive action programme, identified that any participating employee was also entitled to a career development discussion with an adviser, as well as assistance to identify the skills and competencies required for a non-traditional job. Some participants also noted that overall good practice in employee support and development was a route through which such support could be provided.

4.37 In relation to children and young people, the role of the provision of appropriate career guidance was also identified by some organisations. The Scottish Government's evidence review, for example, highlighted the School-College Collaboration project funded by the Scottish Government and managed by Skills Development Scotland, supporting pupils in terms of their career guidance needs. The review noted that there were positive findings in the evaluation of the project, although some gender issues were also highlighted. In one case study area, while there was variation between schools, some had carried out work to ensure the development of advice which avoids stereotyping. One authority also noted that secondary schools offer guidance interviews to all children and young people at option choice times (S2, S4 and S5) and these were used to promote "equality of choice". A small number of participants also noted the development of awareness among careers advisers.

4.38 One organisation noted that work had been carried out with parents of children and young people to help them confront stereotyping of employment choices. More broadly, it was also noted that work had been done with fathers, again including challenging stereotypes. One participant also identified interest in pursuing work to identify whether the computerised systems used in schools to identify suitable jobs for young people used any factors which may promote a preponderance of a particular gender in particular roles.

Employment provisions and equal pay

4.39 A further element of the provision of support to individuals related to employment provisions. As noted in Section 2, many organisations were found to have employment policies which impacted upon occupational segregation by supporting employees and addressing barriers to employment or progression. A number of specific developments to these provisions were identified, including:

- Action to review employment provisions or to extend these further and make "positive amendments". There were some examples of the development of formal policies (e.g. one organisation noted developing a homeworking policy to support previous informal arrangements) and there were also examples of the development of new policies (e.g. the introduction of a homeworking policy after successful pilots). Some organisations also reported an extension of the range of options (e.g. developing options for a compressed working week, home working, term time working etc.). Some local authorities noted that these developments were linked to single status. Some participants stated that such provisions had worked well in addressing barriers to gender equality.
- Action to extend access to provisions, with some examples of rolling out opportunities to a wider range of staff. One local authority, for example, noted that the right to request flexible working had been made available to all employees. An HFE institution noted moving to implement flexible working for promoted posts, where appropriate. Some individual organisations commented that improved use of technology had enabled the more effective use of homeworking and other forms of flexible working. It was also suggested by one organisation that the development of such provisions had improved the overall culture in relation to equalities issues.
- Action to increase staff awareness of existing employment provisions, with examples including promoting, publicising and providing information about provisions such as: flexible working; "family friendly" provisions; equal pay; other policy and practices impacting on occupational segregation; and types of support and opportunities available. Some organisations noted that they had taken specific steps to improve the take-up of particular opportunities such as flexible working by male employees. Some noted using staff magazines, seminars and the provision of information with payslips for this purpose.
- The provision of childcare to staff, students or parents in the community. A number of HFE institutions identified the provision of a children's centre. A substantial number of organisations identified

participation in childcare voucher schemes, and some local authorities identified developments to the provision of access to childcare for parents in the community.

- Actions relating to equal pay, with considerable evidence of the preparation and publication of equal pay statements, as well as evidence of other actions (e.g. single status in local authorities and the Agenda for Change in NHS boards). There were also some specific examples of other work related to equal pay, such as: the completion of job evaluations or audits and follow-up; changes or developments to systems, job evaluation schemes, or structures; changes to pay scales to tackle disparities; and commitments to reviewing equal pay or equal pay statements regularly. The Scottish Government's evidence review and a small number of specific organisations highlighted work by, or with "Close the Gap" to address equal pay issues.

4.40 A small number of other examples were identified, such as exploring the use of "succession planning" to address any gender imbalances identified, and the development of career pathways to support progression.

Research

4.41 There were examples of research being undertaken to develop understanding of occupational segregation, identify issues or inform future action (linked, in some cases, to the types of developments detailed in Section 3). At a national level, the report of the evidence review identified that the Scottish Government has commissioned / undertaken research to inform developments, such as reviews on attitudes to vocational learning and strategies to address gender inequalities in schools. The review also noted that research has been carried out by Children in Scotland as part of work to address gender stereotyping.

4.42 Among individual organisations, some examples from the document review and case studies of issues examined (or to be examined) through research included:

- Barriers to women's progression generally (a number of local authorities) or in specific occupational areas (e.g. police; individual organisation) or in types of working (local authority).
- Overall gender issues in employment (local authority).
- Women in leadership and management (individual organisation).
- Issues for people in non-traditional areas (local authority).
- Gender equality in academia.
- Attitudes to vocational training, subject choice or occupational segregation overall, as well as gender stereotyping in career choice (individual organisations; local authority). One local authority identified an intention to carry out an attitude to work survey with primary school children, before carrying out tasters of different types of work and repeating the survey.
- Factors affecting the progression of women and men in construction (carried out through an organisation based in an HFE institution).
- Issues emerging from workforce monitoring data, such as patterns of occupational segregation or other statistical information.

- Broader equality or gender equality issues, including issues of relevance to occupational segregation (individual organisation).
- Issues for those with caring responsibilities.
- Reasons for a lack of engagement with a particular initiative by organisations in a specific sector (individual organisation).
- Issues for ethnic minority women.

The provision of funding

4.43 A small number of organisations also identified that they had a role in tackling occupational segregation through the provision of funding. This included the provision of funding to particular organisations with a specific remit to tackle relevant issues, as well as the provision of funding to specific projects, programmes and initiatives (e.g. training; positive action work etc.). The Scottish Government's evidence review noted that the Scottish Government continues to support a range of programmes and projects relevant to tackling occupational segregation (with examples given in the report of the review).

Summary of issues: initiatives and specific work

4.44 In summary, the main points raised were as follows:

- There were a large number of examples of initiatives and specific work at a national and organisational level to address occupational segregation, with most organisations carrying out at least some work of this type, although there were variations in the extent and nature of this.
- Examples were identified of overall positive action programmes and employment initiatives, and the relevance of wider programmes was noted.
- Examples were identified of the development and use of measures to recruit and encourage entry to non-traditional areas, including developments to advertising and recruitment processes; the use of materials; awareness raising events; and other methods. Many references were identified to organisations following good equalities practice in recruitment processes and procedures.
- A variety of forms of support to individuals were also identified to enable them to work in non-traditional occupations, or to enable their progression (e.g. mentoring; specific support and advice; support networks; other forms of personal support; and employment provisions).
- A number of organisations had undertaken, or were planning to undertake research relevant to addressing occupational segregation.
- A small number of organisations identified that they had a role in tackling occupational segregation through the provision of funding (for both specialist organisations and specific projects and initiatives) and the provision of national funding was identified in the Scottish Government's evidence review.

SECTION 5: TRAINING AND AWARENESS RAISING

5.1   This section presents findings relating to developments which were identified in training and awareness raising. The work identified in the research included both training and awareness raising with staff, and training and awareness raising with members of the community. Although some awareness raising was noted in the previous section (in terms of identifying options for non-traditional work, career progression etc.), the material covered in this section focuses specifically on work to increase knowledge and develop understanding of relevant issues. There was not always a clear distinction between training and awareness raising, and both forms of work are described together.

5.2   Examples of developments to training and awareness raising were highlighted in the Scottish Government's evidence review and in this research. The document review and case studies identified that a large majority of organisations had undertaken some form of training or awareness raising, and many of the schemes and annual reports described developments to equality training generally. Some more specific examples of training relating to addressing occupational segregation (or particular aspects of this) were also found. While, as with other aspects of work to tackle occupational segregation, it would be impossible to provide evaluation information from the range of training identified, a number of participants identified the importance of such developments and provided examples of the perceived benefits. The role of training and awareness raising in developing understanding of occupational segregation, informing practice, promoting opportunities and addressing individual experiences was stressed frequently.

Training and awareness raising - staff

5.3   The document review and case studies identified two main types of training and awareness raising for staff within organisations. These were: training and awareness raising for managers and staff in order to develop their own understanding of the issues and to guide their practice; and training and awareness raising aimed at members of staff in under-represented groups to address their experiences of occupational segregation (either through enabling them to enter non-traditional roles or to progress in an organisation).

The development of practice / understanding

5.4   In terms of developing practice and understanding, the Scottish Government's evidence review identified the development of practice in a specific sector through work to increase the status of the early years' workforce and to improve leadership, noting the development of a "Scottish Benchmark Standard for Childhood Practice" and a "Career Pathways Toolkit". The review also highlighted that the Close the Gap partnership had developed and piloted, with others, a one-day course on the economics of occupational segregation, being rolled out to public sector organisations to support gender equality duty compliance.

5.5   Much of the training found in the document reviews and case studies relating to the development of practice and understanding among staff was at the level of general equality training and awareness raising. The focus of this tended to be upon general good equalities practice, sometimes with particular content relating to gender

equality, or to duties and responsibilities within relevant legislation. Most organisations identified work of this type.

5.6   Some schemes and annual reports gave examples of equality training with a focus upon particular staff (e.g. those involved in recruitment and selection; managers; those in specific academic faculties; those carrying out EQIAs etc.); some described the materials used or the content of the training; some mentioned changes to the ways in which equality training was provided (e.g. on-line, DVD information; inclusion in induction etc.); and some mentioned work to mainstream equality training (e.g. including this in other training, such as leadership development).

5.7   As noted previously, general equality training is relevant in terms of the links between good practice in equalities work and tackling occupational segregation, which is a form of gender inequality. The identification of issues, for example, such as the nature of inequality and discrimination on the basis of gender, and the identification of the need to address barriers and promote diversity, are clearly important elements of understanding occupational segregation. Some case study participants also gave specific examples of how the content of equality training was linked to tackling occupational segregation.

5.8   Although relatively few examples were identified relating to the development of overall practice and understanding in tackling occupational segregation specifically, these included:

- Training (formal and less formal) to ensure that specific staff offering guidance understood issues such as the gender pay gap, occupational segregation and opportunities in non-traditional areas, and provided appropriate advice (with examples from HFE institutions).
- Awareness raising with staff involved in Modern Apprenticeships (local authority).
- Training for those making decisions about pay (e.g. local authorities; individual organisation; HFE institution).
- Training for new managers relating to policies such as flexible working and values in policy implementation (local authority).
- The inclusion of issues relating to stereotyping in training provision to those involved in recruitment and selection (organisations of different types).
- Training for education staff on gender stereotypes and measures to avoid them (local authority); training for education staff on promoting non-traditional roles to pupils and using particular materials (local authorities); training for staff to develop new ways of engaging girls and young women in sport; and targeted education to women coaches.
- Training for head teachers on gender inequality and the gender pay gap, as well as barriers to participation in gendered occupations and to women's progression to senior posts (local authority).
- The provision of workshops for primary school teachers in relation to the STEM work (identified previously).
- Work with service managers to tackle cultural stereotypes (local authority).
- Training on mentoring (police) and coaching skills (local authority).

- Awareness raising with departments about developing their statistical information and carrying out analysis of this, as well as presentations about occupational segregation (local authority).
- A school / college event with a planned topic of occupational segregation (HFE institution).

5.9   There were also a number of examples of other means of developing practice and understanding among staff through the provision of guidance, tools and other advice. One local authority, for example, had prepared a guide for HR managers focusing on "Managing Diversity in the Workplace" within which there was information about occupational segregation, a focus on positive action, and examples of a range of relevant provisions and initiatives. The same authority noted that there would be a section on gender within an equality toolkit being developed by its HR team. Another organisation gave an example of the production of factsheets to assist in targeting women and girls. Work was identified to prepare national guidance on coaching and mentoring (police) and one individual organisation noted the inclusion of issues relating to the avoidance of gender stereotyping or segregation in national guidance on a particular programme. One HFE institution identified providing information on a particular programme through roadshows, while an individual organisation identified presentations at managers' meetings. Some organisations in rural areas were found to have been involved in intranet-based awareness raising, to enable participation by those in isolated areas. There were also examples of informal attempts to "get the message out" about aspects of occupational segregation.

5.10 A small number of local authorities identified materials for schools, including the introduction or use of the "Teachers' Toolkit on Gender Equality in Education" produced by Learning and Teaching Scotland. One local authority also noted having identified any continuing professional development (CPD) implications of this. An individual organisation identified good practice guidance to support schools in promoting girls and young women into sport. One local authority identified having audited its personal and social education (PSE) curriculum for equality in 2006, leading to changes to curricular advice, including advice on non-traditional career choices.

Addressing individual experiences of occupational segregation

5.11 A number of examples were provided (generally via the case studies) of training and awareness raising for staff which aimed to address individual experiences of occupational segregation. Within this, the training highlighted most commonly was work to enable staff to progress within an organisation, generally through personal and leadership development. This was identified by some participants as being directly relevant to encouraging and enabling women into management.

5.12 In this context, a number of organisations provided information about their overall management development provision. In most cases, it was noted that this was open to both women and men, although a number identified a high representation of women on these courses. One local authority suggested that around three-quarters of the delegates to a current management development course were women. An HFE institution made similar observations about a course

aimed at non-promoted staff which was predominantly attended by women, while a local authority suggested that take-up of opportunities for training for school headship was currently predominantly by women. Another local authority identified that a development programme for middle managers, and a programme for heads of service, while not aimed specifically at addressing gender issues, were offered partly in order to provide women with the skills to move to more senior positions. A further local authority identified moving to a "targeted" approach to such provision.

5.13 A small number of examples were identified of gender-specific training (most commonly in local authorities, but also in some HFE institutions, police and individual organisations). The focus of much, although not all of this training was again upon personal and management development for women.

5.14 A number of examples of the use of the "Springboard Women's Development Programme"[16] were given by organisations of different types. There were also a small number of examples of organisations having, or developing their own women's programmes. One local authority, for example, undertook a development programme for women which aimed to increase the number of women managers and leaders by "developing their skills, abilities and confidence". Another local authority was, at the time of this research, working on a women's development scheme which would target women at various levels. In a further local authority, while there was no corporate training specifically for women, it was noted that the social work service offered Springboard to staff. One HFE institution also identified an intention to develop a specific strand of a management development programme for women. Examples were provided of provision being well-attended, positive feedback from this type of training and perceptions that it had been successful.

5.15 There were a small number of examples of gender-specific training for male staff, with two local authorities identifying the use of the "Navigator Men's Development Programme"[17]. One police participant also noted that there may be forthcoming opportunities for such work with men as means of promoting culture and attitude change.

5.16 Although most of the training to address individual experiences of occupational segregation for staff within organisations focused on provision to enable progression to more senior positions, one local authority identified using positive action training programmes to allow women and men to access training in non-traditional roles. This was part of a broader positive action programme for staff (identified earlier) with consideration being given to allowing special leave to attend courses relating to the achievement of a qualification.

5.17 There were a small number of examples of the provision of (or access to) training through a women's network or development organisation. One, for example, provided a leadership programme with a course identified as being "very similar to Springboard". This organisation arranged a variety of training courses and events,

---

[16] This is a development programme for women of all backgrounds, ages and stages, to enable them to identify steps they want to take in their lives and develop the skills and confidence to take them.
[17] This is a personal and work development programme which was designed for non-management and junior management men in response to the success of its sister Springboard Women's Development Programme. It enables men to identify the steps they want to take in their lives and develop the skills and determination to take them.

which were generally available to both women and men, although it was noted that there had been some "positive action" courses and development events specifically for women. One police force identified that a day for women, focusing on promotion and development was planned.

5.18 Some participants gave examples of less formal training or awareness raising, which was generally focused upon developing opportunities for progression. One local authority, for example, had run "women into management" seminars, with role model speakers and discussions, while others mentioned gender workshops. It was suggested in one case study that action had been taken to address some of the barriers identified. There was also an example of an event for "women into education management". One HFE institution identified having established a "women's career development network", with a number of seminars around issues such as applying for promotion. Two organisations identified having held women's conferences and one noted that such an event had been very successful.

5.19 An HFE institution stated that it intended to introduce more coaching for staff in order to tackle gender representation at a senior level. Alongside this, team building for the senior management team was being developed. The development of mentoring work noted in the previous section is also clearly closely linked to this type of work.

Training and awareness raising - community members

5.20 Examples were also identified in the Scottish Government's evidence review and in this research of training and awareness raising among community members to address occupational segregation. This was of two main types: provision which addressed overall understanding of occupational segregation; and provision aimed at enabling people to enter employment or undertake courses in non-traditional areas.

The development of understanding

5.21 Some of the work undertaken to develop understanding within the wider community about issues relating to occupational segregation was identified in the previous section (in the form of work to promote awareness of opportunities and to avoid the promotion of stereotypes). A small number of other initiatives more directly targeted at developing understanding of the issues were also identified. The focus of these initiatives was often upon work with children and young people, although other examples were also identified.

5.22 Examples of training and awareness raising aimed at developing understanding or changing attitudes of members of the community (or specific groups within this) were:

- A gender equality campaign in one area which was supported by the local authority and drew attention to the gender pay gap.
- A "Do Something Creative. Do Science" campaign to tackle stereotypes about science which ran in 2009, followed by a similar campaign in 2009 / 10. Research suggested that young people responded well to

the campaign messages (highlighted in the Scottish Government's evidence review).

- Work to develop understanding of non-traditional roles through awareness raising in the community as part of a wider positive action initiative.
- Diversity and equality training for students in construction (HFE institution).
- A session during a local diversity week, open to staff and members of the public, where a representative of a women's organisation and an academic discussed occupational segregation and its global economic impact (local authority).
- An international women's day session on women at work (individual organisation).
- The inclusion of occupational segregation issues in presentations to parents at points of option choices for their children and young people.
- Work with men as parents to challenge stereotyping (local authority).
- Work with a local young people's group to raise awareness of the gender pay gap (local authority) and issue-based youth work focusing on stereotyping (mentioned by some local authorities).
- The development and use of resources, with examples including "Career Box" which can tackle gender stereotyping in schools, and other resources (e.g. Determined to Succeed and Skills for Work) which use non-traditional images of women and men in employment (with examples of these resources given by some local authorities and highlighted in the Scottish Government's evidence review).
- The use of an interactive theatre presentation in a number of schools tackling gender stereotyping in subject and career choice (local authority and identified in the Scottish Government's evidence review).
- The use of other curricular and play materials to raise awareness of stereotyping and promote gender awareness among children and young people. Examples included: "Changing Times"; "Girls in the Physics Classroom"; "Determined to Succeed"; "Real Game"; and "Equip". The availability of other relevant resources was also noted.
- The development by Close the Gap of materials for a campaign to raise awareness of non-stereotypical career choices with young people aged between 11 and 14, teachers and parents (highlighted in the Scottish Government's evidence review).
- The discussion of issues in overall work with children and young people. Some participants suggested that the Curriculum for Excellence offered an opportunity to include such issues, and the Gender Equality Toolkit (noted earlier) was also highlighted in this context. It was also suggested that PSE offers opportunities to tackle these issues. One local authority also noted that all early years and primary establishments promote understanding through looking at the "world of work".

Provision to develop opportunities or promote entry to non-traditional roles

5.23 As with staff within organisations, there were also examples of provision which focused on addressing individual experiences of occupational segregation, or developing opportunities in non-traditional roles for members of the wider community.

5.24 Some examples of gender-specific provision, or positive action initiatives, were identified. A number of HFE institutions, for example, identified courses which were designed to encourage women and men to participate in courses which were historically stereotyped. The most common examples were "women into construction" and "men into childcare". One HFE institution identified that it had also been involved in running courses in engineering and IT for women. Some examples of success in attracting women or men to participate in such non-traditional courses were also identified (e.g. one of the colleges suggested that such courses were becoming more popular). As was noted in the previous section, a number of computer clubs for girls were also established.

5.25 There were also examples of courses focusing on women returning to the labour market. One local authority identified that some work had been carried out with a group of ethnic minority women to develop their employment skills. One individual organisation also identified the provision of training and guidance to assist women undergraduates and researchers to improve their knowledge of opportunities and link them to advisers and funders. One local authority noted the provision in its area of women into business workshops. Another noted the long standing provision of training through a local women's technology centre from which, it was suggested, a high proportion of women had entered further education and / or employment.

5.26 As noted previously, some training and awareness raising undertaken with members of the wider community was linked to positive action initiatives, where these contained a training element. The Scottish Government's evidence review, for example, noted that training and / or awareness raising work had been carried out through Men in Childcare as well as in work by Children in Scotland to tackle gender stereotyping and occupational segregation. The review also noted work by Close the Gap relating to equal pay. Among specific organisations, in one local authority, training to enable men and boys into childcare was found to be provided, targeting pre-school leavers, school leavers and unemployed men. This took place alongside a range of other awareness raising activities and work with schools and community groups. Another local authority highlighted an initiative to encourage women into construction. Similarly, training elements were included in the work identified earlier as being undertaken with an all-women refuse team. A number of wider employment-related programmes identified in the previous section also involved training, with examples of provision through programmes designed to support women into, or in work. As noted, some examples of successes were highlighted in these types of work.

5.27 Examples were also identified of work through Modern Apprenticeships, work experience and vocational training (VT). As noted in the previous section, at a general level, a number of organisations identified steps to ensure equality in recruitment and in the nature of provision. One individual organisation with a key role in national programmes stated that these programmes have had a specific focus on

non-traditional areas and addressing occupational segregation over a number of years. One local authority provided an example of extending the types of work in which Modern Apprenticeships were made available, and the development of a "more diverse scheme". Some also provided examples of young people who had entered non-traditional areas of work and who had been successful (e.g. one young woman in a non-traditional trade who had won the title of Scottish Modern Apprentice in a particular year). One local authority noted an increase in the number of female trade apprenticeships and the uptake of non-traditional VT work placements. One HFE institution also noted the design of a new Modern Apprenticeship allowing people already in work to be accredited. It was suggested that many of the beneficiaries of this would be women, whose other commitments may make attendance at classes in the evening difficult.

5.28 A small number of examples were also identified of the development of access or preparatory courses in other specific areas. For example, one HFE institution identified an access course which had been developed to help address traditional gender-based employment patterns in music technology and art and design. One police force also identified that a development day (whilst open to women and men) had focused on "preparing for selection". It was suggested that feedback from those involved had been positive. Another force noted that staff were "very willing" to work with someone to prepare them for the formal recruitment process. It was also suggested that the development of a Higher National Certificate (HNC) in policing studies may encourage younger women to consider a career in the police where they might not otherwise have done so, and may contribute to increasing their numbers among recruits. One local authority undertook pre-recruitment training for homecare staff, following the recognition that a significant number of women were applying and being unsuccessful. A training course was developed to enable them to recognise their skills, and those who had been unsuccessful were offered this with a view to employment where appropriate. It was suggested that this had increased the number of successes.

5.29 A small number of examples were identified of work to enable women in the community to progress in their sector. One individual organisation noted, for example, that qualifications were being established which would be appropriate for women middle managers in a specific sector (contact centres). There were also examples of the development of training and qualifications in other sectors (e.g. energy). It was also noted that events had taken place for women-led businesses.

Practical developments

5.30 Examples were found of general developments to practice and procedures which helped address barriers and enable access to provision for both staff and members of the community. These included:

- Consideration of the timing of provision, with a number of examples of organisations timing events and seminars to suit potential participants. One organisation, for example, noted arranging seminars during working hours while others provided training in the evening, both to recognise the other commitments of participants. One HFE institution promoted evening and Saturday classes to attract male students to a non-traditional area. One individual organisation also noted ensuring

that opportunities for training were available at different times to enable access by people employed in "non-standard" working patterns. A police force noted that some courses had been run to meet the needs of staff with flexible working arrangements.

- Provision in appropriate venues. One HFE institution, for example, identified that introductory courses in non-traditional areas generally took place in community venues at times to suit participants.
- Development of informal and easily accessible means of delivery.
- Use of appropriate speakers. One local authority, for example, identified action to improve the gender balance of speakers on management development programmes.
- Consideration of transport issues. One local authority noted that, in carrying out work to promote return to learning (predominantly taken up by women), the need to remove barriers such as a lack of access to transport was considered.
- Provision of additional support to people attending training.
- The use of a range of delivery methods, some of which targeted under-represented groups.

5.31 All of these provisions were intended to remove barriers to training and promote access to this.

Summary of issues: training and awareness raising

5.32 In summary, the main points raised were as follows:

- Examples of developments to training and awareness raising were highlighted in the Scottish Government's evidence review and in this research.
- Most authorities had undertaken training or awareness raising which was relevant in some way to tackling occupational segregation.
- There were developments to general equality training and training relating to addressing aspects of occupational segregation.
- Some training or awareness raising was found to have been targeted towards staff and managers, while other work was targeted towards members of the community.
- Training and awareness raising for staff included: to develop their own understanding of the issues (often at the level of general equality training but in some cases relating specifically to occupational segregation); and to address individuals' experiences of occupational segregation.
- Examples were also identified of training and awareness raising among community members, involving work to address overall understanding of occupational segregation, and training aimed at enabling people to enter employment or undertake courses in non-traditional areas.
- A number of authorities identified practical ways in which they had tried to break down barriers which perpetuate aspects of occupational segregation, including: giving consideration to the timing, location, venues and methods used for training and events; staffing of courses and at events; consideration of transport; and provision of other support.

SECTION 6: ENABLING FACTORS, CONSTRAINTS AND SUGGESTED DEVELOPMENTS

6.1   The previous sections have identified a range of forms of work and examples of progress within public authorities to address occupational segregation. The focus of the preceding sections has been upon highlighting relevant developments to inform the report on progress being made against the ministerial priority. It has also provided a means of sharing information about work which could be adopted by other public authorities. The focus has been on identifying positive developments rather than on auditing or evaluating the work. While this is an appropriate focus for this report, it is also important to acknowledge that there remains a need to develop work to address occupational segregation in Scotland.

6.2   The document review and case studies identified significant variation between public authorities in the extent and nature of work undertaken across all of the types of developments explored. While some public authorities had undertaken substantial work to address the issue, it was clear that there were others in which developments had been limited. It was also clear that, within the sample, there were variations in understanding of the nature of the issues and perceptions of the work seen to be required or relevant, with such variations likely to be replicated among other public authorities covered by the duty. The research did not suggest that there was a consistent pattern across authorities, nor that no further work was required. For these reasons, it was considered important for the research to identify: factors which were seen to enable work to address occupational segregation; some of the constraints which public authorities faced in carrying out such work; and participants' views of developments required in the future.

Enabling factors and constraints

6.3   Almost all of the case study participants identified factors which enabled them to address occupational segregation or which constrained this work. There was considerable overlap between the factors identified (although the specific nature of the issues varied). Those identified most commonly as impacting (either positively or negatively) upon work to tackle occupational segregation were in the following broad categories:

- The national context.
- The organisational context.
- Knowledge and understanding.
- Ways of working.
- Information and other resources.
- Other issues.

The national context

6.4   The importance of clear leadership and direction at a national level was stressed, while enabling work at a local level to suit the circumstances. Related to this, it was suggested that a visible high priority being given to tackling occupational segregation may be a useful means of promoting such work. Some participants also expressed the view that the Gender Equality Duty has been helpful in encouraging public authorities to address this issue. One participant suggested that the legislation

could provide a useful "lever" for work, particularly where there was resistance. It was also suggested that other national imperatives, such as equal pay and statutory performance indicators, could also enable progress. Some suggested that national developments, such as Curriculum for Excellence, could provide a useful means of focusing attention on specific issues, as well as promoting the notion of equality as being everyone's responsibility.

6.5   A small number of organisations of different types suggested that there was not currently a clear national "lead" on occupational segregation in the way that was seen to be the case for tackling violence against women, nor a "clear steer" in relation to the direction of work. It was also suggested that advice and guidance was not always readily accessible. A concern was also expressed by some that the focus on multiple, rather than single equality strands had diluted the focus upon gender issues. One NHS board also suggested that public bodies were not being "held to account" for their actions.

The organisational context

6.6   Most case studies identified aspects of the organisational context as important enabling factors in taking forward work. Among these, the issues raised most frequently were: the provision of support and commitment; the value of an appropriate structure; and the benefits of having staff with a remit to support the work.

6.7   A number of participants from organisations of different types stressed the importance of support and commitment from a senior level, with some providing examples of having received this type of support. The provision of clear leadership and direction on tackling occupational segregation, as well as "momentum" for taking action, were also highlighted as enabling factors, and their absence was highlighted as a constraint. One local authority identified the value of support from elected members, and this was thought to have provided a higher public profile for the issue. The lack of such support and commitment, conversely, was seen as a constraint.

6.8   Some identified the benefits of a supportive overall culture and ethos within the organisation, and a general commitment to equality, as helping to enable work. Examples were also given of the value of positive role models (for example, high profile senior women staff) by some organisations. A number of participants, however, also identified difficulties with the culture within their organisation (or parts of their organisation), such as stereotypical, "gender-blind" and inappropriate attitudes, which could constrain work to address occupational segregation. One local authority suggested that it was difficult to ensure a consistent culture throughout the organisation. One HFE institution identified some continuing evidence of inflexible practice (e.g. breakfast meetings and meetings late in the day) and another participant suggested that there could be persistent problems with day-to-day experiences of discrimination faced by people in non-traditional areas of work (e.g. from colleagues and in the form of other workplace barriers).

6.9   Several participants also provided examples of ways in which an appropriate structure could enable work to address occupational segregation. Some identified a specific group or network which they considered beneficial (including some of those described in Section 2). One NHS board suggested that the existence of clear

structural arrangements could make inaction less likely. Another NHS board suggested that there could be structural constraints, not only in a lack of clear means of addressing the issue, but also where the cross-cutting nature of equalities issues was not recognised. One local authority suggested that an inflexible, bureaucratic approach could also be a constraint. One police participant identified that those involved in undertaking work may not be at a sufficiently senior level to influence change, while another noted that resistance to change could also create a barrier to undertaking work. It was also suggested that particular types of work (e.g. mentoring) could be difficult in a small organisation with fewer staff available, although, conversely, it was also suggested that informal developments could arguably be taken forward more readily in smaller public authorities. Some organisations identified that those in large or rural areas could also face particular challenges (e.g. availability of resources to provide support or promote developments in remote parts of the area; and differences between the requirements of particular parts of a large area).

6.10 It was also suggested that the development and promotion of a strategic approach to the issue, along with related policy and practice developments, were important in helping enable work to take place. Again, however, examples were also given of a lack of strategic approach constraining developments. One local authority, for example, identified this in its own organisation. One HFE institution also suggested that, in the absence of a strategic approach, work could depend on individuals and could be at risk if that individual left the organisation.

6.11 A small number of participants identified new opportunities for addressing occupational segregation, brought about by changes to the structure of the organisations (e.g. restructuring, redeployment or the impact of demographic changes). A number of participants identified, however, that there could also be structural constraints where there was a lack of opportunity for career progression. It was suggested by some local authorities, for example, that there were few jobs available at management level, making progression difficult. One NHS board also noted a lack of movement among staff. These issues are also linked to the availability of resources (discussed below).

6.12 There was also seen by some to be a need for staff with a specialist role, or an identified remit for taking this work forward, to support and promote developments. The benefits of identifiable staff who would highlight these issues were identified by a number of participants, with some stating that this approach was not incompatible with all staff having some responsibility to promote the issues, nor with mainstreaming. One organisation, however, believed that its work was constrained by the lack of an identified member of staff in HR dealing with equality issues.

6.13 A further enabling factor identified was the need for "buy-in" throughout the organisation to the importance of tackling occupational segregation. It was suggested that there is a need for staff at all levels to recognise the issue and the implications for their own role. There were, however, examples of variation in commitment, engagement and "buy-in". For example, one NHS board suggested that occupational segregation was not really perceived to be an issue in that sector. Another suggested that there had been a tendency to view tackling occupational segregation as an HR responsibility, or to wait for these staff to take the lead. A small number of participants from other organisations highlighted "complacency" or a

lack of involvement of particular staff in tackling these issues. One organisation suggested a lack of involvement of men. Another suggested that some women may not engage with the issues, and that there could be difficulties in undertaking positive action work. All of these issues can be seen to link to the overall level of knowledge and understanding of occupational segregation and equalities issues more generally, discussed in more detail below.

Knowledge and understanding

6.14 The level of knowledge and understanding of equalities issues generally, and occupational segregation more specifically, was also identified as having an impact upon the development of work. Some organisations, for example, suggested that there was a good level of understanding at senior levels, and this was seen to have a positive influence. Related to this, some participants stressed the value of training as a means of developing knowledge and understanding. It was also suggested that the provision of guidance and examples of practice could help to inform work.

6.15 A number of participants, however, identified variations in the level of understanding and interest both within and between organisations. This was seen to relate both to occupational segregation specifically and to wider equalities issues. One local authority, for example, stated that, while HR staff understood occupational segregation issues, this was more patchy in other services, where there could be considerable variation between staff in the level of awareness of the issue, and in attitudes to occupational segregation. Another suggested that some staff may lack experience in particular forms of work. Several organisations identified "entrenched views" among some staff. One individual organisation suggested that there could be a lack of understanding of the issue among businesses, and that this could also impact upon work. It was also suggested that, even where there is a commitment to developing work, organisations may lack understanding of the types of action they can take. There were also seen to be some gaps in training, including refresher training and subject-specific training.

6.16 A specific lack of understanding of the gender inequality underpinning occupational segregation was highlighted by a number of organisations (particularly some local authorities and police forces). This was seen to link to a lack of understanding of the nature of positive action which, in turn, was seen to impact upon the nature of action taken (and in some cases, to lead to a "gender-blind" approach being adopted). It could also impact on perceptions and experiences of positive action initiatives where these were undertaken (e.g. a view that women were being "singled out"; perceptions of "special treatment"; and experiences of "teasing" and other forms of discrimination for participants).

6.17 At the level of individual posts, it was also suggested that a lack of detailed knowledge of requirements could also constrain work to tackle occupational segregation. One local authority and one police force, for example, identified perceptions of different types of work which they considered may deter potential applicants.

6.18 In relation to EQIAs, while some participants identified their value in developing knowledge and understanding, there were also seen to be some remaining problems. One organisation suggested, for example, that EQIAs were sometimes

perceived as time-consuming, while another suggested that the process was currently "burdensome". A police force identified that the guidance was not sufficiently focused in relation to their completion. Another participant highlighted that there was variation across the organisation in the quality of work undertaken on EQIAs, and in the likelihood of identifying relevant issues. A local authority also suggested that, where negative impacts and issues were found, these were often countered with a "reason" in an EQIA, which led to no action being taken.

Ways of working

6.19 At a general level, the links between good practice in equalities work and the development of work to tackle occupational segregation have been identified in previous sections. It was suggested, for example, that good equalities practice in recruitment and employment (as well as more generally) could assist in identifying and addressing barriers. However, it was also suggested that some of the current requirements of posts could present barriers and constrain developments. One participant identified an example of full-time residential training causing difficulties for some potential recruits. Some issues relating to the culture of an organisation were also seen to link to ways of working which could constrain developments to tackling occupational segregation (e.g. long hours; a "macho" culture etc.).

6.20 The importance of mainstreaming was stressed frequently in the context of developing good practice in tackling occupational segregation. For example, one NHS board identified the need to embed the work within the "weft and weave" of an organisation. This was also seen to enhance the likelihood of sustainability. As noted in Section 2, some developments to mainstreaming were identified, and some participants reiterated these in the context of identifying enabling factors.

6.21 A number of remaining constraints with mainstreaming were also identified, however. Some participants identified the impact of varying levels of understanding among staff, both of occupational segregation and wider equalities issues (noted above) which could impact upon the extent to which these issues are mainstreamed both at a corporate and department level. Variations in willingness to engage with the issues among staff were also suggested, and this was seen to impact upon the extent to which mainstreaming could take place. One participant suggested that, while there had been progress in mainstreaming equalities work generally, work to tackle occupational segregation remained "pocketed". Another suggested that the loss of a specialist approach could lead to a loss of specialist understanding (and the dismantling of structures) which could, in turn mean that the issue became "everyone's business but nobody's business".

6.22 The benefits of partnership working were also identified by some participants, both between different parts of an organisation and between organisations with a shared interest. A number of organisations also identified that information sharing was a useful way of identifying potential developments to practice. It was also identified, however, that there was a view in some organisations that work to address occupational segregation was seen as an "internal" issue and this, it was suggested, could constrain joint working. It was also suggested that any reluctance, or lack of resources, in other partners could impact on the work undertaken by this means. The benefits of making links between work to tackle occupational segregation and other strategic decision making were also noted.

6.23 Other aspects of ways of working which were identified as enabling progress (or having led to positive work within particular organisations) included: good communication; opportunities for innovation; confidence; willingness to change; delegation and empowerment; consultation, engagement and involvement; leadership by example; joined-up working; transparent working; and the recognition of achievements.

Information and other resources

6.24 The collection and presentation of data, and the development of the evidence base to make a case for work, were also seen to be among the enabling factors in tackling occupational segregation. Some remaining constraints in information and gaps in data, however, were also highlighted. These included: the limited level of detail in some of the statistical information; gaps and difficulties in the collection of some information; lack of participation in some staff surveys; inconsistencies and variation in data collection and methods within or between organisations; lack of input and feedback from some parts of organisations (e.g. some schools or specific departments or divisions); instances of limited benchmarking; shortcomings in data analysis, reporting and the use of information. One local authority also identified the difficulty of identifying cause and effect in work to tackle occupational segregation, particularly in terms of evaluating whether change is a result of initiatives or wider societal change.

6.25 Several organisations also identified the importance of financial resources in enabling work to tackle occupational segregation. A number of participants identified financial constraints which they faced (sometimes in relation to specific types of occupational segregation work). The related issue of competing demands on budgets and competing priorities was also raised. In this context, a number of concerns were expressed about the priority which would be given to tackling occupational segregation. Even within the overall area of equalities work it was suggested that there could be a "hierarchy" of issues, and some participants believed that gender was not always viewed as a high priority.

6.26 The impact of the wider financial climate on tackling occupational segregation was also noted. A number of participants suggested that the current financial climate meant that recruitment was restricted and that this had an impact on the work that could be done. One local authority also suggested the loss of jobs in the private sector could also have an impact. A specific example was given where a number of posts had been advertised in previously male-dominated areas of work and where it had been hoped women could have been encouraged to apply. However, recent job losses in the construction industry were seen to have led to a very large number of men applying, and this, in turn, was perceived to have impacted upon the gender balance of the appointments made.

6.27 It was noted that there may be variations in the level of resources between organisations in terms of the ratio of HR staff to other staff, which was seen to create an obstacle to developing work. It was also suggested that difficulties with the "usability" of some materials could also be a constraint. One HFE institution also identified that a lack of access to computing facilities for some staff could impact upon their access to information. The need for time for staff, to have the opportunity for reflection in relation to such issues, was also noted.

Other issues

6.28 Some organisations expressed the view that there had been considerable progress in tackling occupational segregation in their organisation. Conversely, however, one participant stated generally that this was an area of work in which they had struggled to "make a difference" because of the types of constraints identified. It was also suggested that there had been limited work undertaken to address specific issues for groups such as people from ethnic minority communities and others who may experience a range of barriers in combination. A number of local authorities also identified the long term nature and the extent and range of work needed to tackle occupational segregation.

6.29 A number of organisations identified occupational segregation as affected by a range of other constraints. Examples given included that:

- For some organisations involved with young people (e.g. in relation to Modern Apprenticeships), choices were made prior to the involvement of the organisation.
- Some schools were seen to be less engaged in tackling stereotyping or promoting choice than others, with examples noted of perceived persistent stereotyping.
- There can be difficulties in obtaining non-traditional work placements with some employers.
- It can be difficult to get people to apply to non-traditional areas of work, thus constraining the pool of applicants.
- Public authorities have limited influence on decisions made by organisations in the private sector, and by third parties.
- Parental, societal and media influences can affect views of employment opportunities and constrain the work of individual organisations.

Suggested developments

6.30 Almost all of the case study participants identified developments at a national and local level which they would like to see in the future, and some simply stressed the need for work to continue. The issues raised above in themselves suggest a range of ways of taking this work forward which will not be reiterated in detail, but some specific suggestions included the need for:

- Leadership and clear policy direction, with: a consistent message; a clear definition of the issues to be addressed; and specified expectations in terms of the nature and extent of work considered reasonable, supported by target-setting and a focus on outcomes.
- Clear, transparent and appropriate structures through which to tackle occupational segregation, and the development of a strategic and co-ordinated approach. Commitment and responsibility, with clear links between relevant areas of work.
- Good equalities practice and mainstreaming throughout public authorities' work, with joined-up working; consultation, engagement and involvement, and a focus on the elements of appropriate ways of working identified earlier.

- Improvements in the level of understanding of the issue, with suggestions including: specific training on occupational segregation; advice, guidance, feedback and examples of good practice; the use of pilot projects and learning from other initiatives; a national public awareness campaign; and other work to promote wider understanding.
- Developments in monitoring and reporting, including: better collection, analysis and reporting; greater consistency; more effective use of EQIAs; national support for monitoring; and national statistical information broken down at a local level.
- The development of new initiatives, with: proactive work and positive action across a range of areas and types of organisations; work with children and young people from an early age; work with adults; and work targeting particular groups.
- Resources to support work, including: funding (overall and for specific programmes and positive action); materials; and appropriate timescales.

Summary of issues: enabling factors, constraints and suggested developments

6.31 In summary, the main points raised were as follows:

- Enabling factors and constraints were found in the following broad categories: the national context; the organisational context; knowledge and understanding; ways of working; information and other resources; and other issues.
- In terms of the overall national context, enabling factors included: clear leadership and direction; high priority; national imperatives and initiatives.
- In terms of the local organisational context, enabling factors included: support and commitment; structure and staff; culture, role models and commitment.
- The level of knowledge and understanding of equalities issues generally, as well as of occupational segregation, was also identified as a key factor, although this was seen to vary between and across authorities.
- A number of beneficial ways of working were highlighted, although there were seen to be some constraints to aspects of these.
- The key role of data in helping to make the case for work to address occupational segregation was identified, although gaps in coverage, detail, consistency and use were highlighted.
- Several organisations highlighted the importance of financial resources in enabling work to tackle occupational segregation, but identified some constraints to this.
- A number of organisations identified occupational segregation as affected by a range of other constraints outwith the control of specific organisations.
- Some key developments were identified as being required at a national and local level.

SECTION 7: LINKS TO MINISTERIAL PORTFOLIOS

7.1   This section summarises the main findings of the report as they relate to ministerial portfolios, although the nature of equalities work is cross-cutting, and many of the findings are relevant across portfolios. Participants' views of developments required also have implications for Scottish Ministers, and these are also summarised. It should be borne in mind that this is a brief overview of these findings, and cannot cover all of the detailed examples in the previous sections. As has been stressed, this research did not constitute an audit of progress, but provided examples from a sample of organisations. It is not intended to provide a comprehensive picture by portfolio, but a general summary of some relevant developments.

Cross-cutting developments (all portfolio areas)

7.2   These findings are relevant across all portfolio areas. Overall, evidence of work to tackle occupational segregation has been found across a range of types of organisations covered by the Gender Equality Duty in Scotland, with most organisations found to be carrying out at least some work of this type, although the extent and nature varied. Much of this work was found to relate to work taking place within individual organisations to tackle workforce issues, making many of the findings relevant across portfolio areas.

7.3   Findings relating to developments to **structures, strategy and policy** which were of cross-cutting relevance were:

- There were examples at a national level and in specific organisations of the development of aims, objectives, commitments, strategies and policies relevant to tackling occupational segregation, some with a specific expressed focus on this.
- Occupational segregation was often viewed as an equalities and / or HR issue. Many public authorities recognised (to some extent) its relevance to them.
- Many of the overall developments that have taken place in equalities work in recent years appear to have had some impact upon identifying or tackling the issues related to occupational segregation.
- There were structures in many organisations through which the issue could be considered, and some links between equalities and workforce developments.
- Workforce policies and practices to promote gender equality were linked to work to tackle occupational segregation, and there were examples of progress and developments to these across organisations of different types.
- In some organisations, there was more limited recognition of a wider role in addressing occupational segregation.
- There were some examples of partnership working between organisations.
- There were examples of work taking place through specialist organisations which received public funding.
- Most participants identified perceived developments towards mainstreaming work relevant to tackling occupational segregation.

7.4   Findings relating to developments to **information gathering, monitoring and reporting** which were of cross-cutting relevance were:

- There was evidence of developments to information gathering and monitoring at a national level and in many organisations, with relevant national statistics identified and organisational information collected (e.g. workforce issues such as make-up by gender; recruitment, selection, training etc.).
- There have also been developments to consultation, involvement and engagement, particularly of staff, but also involving community members.
- A variety of means of reporting were identified, with some examples of the inclusion of information in schemes and annual reports, and some specific information provision. There were also examples of other uses of the data (e.g. review or analysis; further research; management information; identification of actions; dissemination etc.).
- There was some evidence of changes to employment patterns in organisations of a range of types. Several organisations indicated positive findings, or improvements in their own organisation, although there was also evidence of continuing issues.

7.5   Findings relating to developments to **initiatives and specific work** which were of cross-cutting relevance were:

- The research found a number of examples of initiatives and specific work to address occupational segregation at a national and organisational level.
- There were examples of positive action programmes and other initiatives, with work to encourage and enable women into management and senior posts, work to encourage entry to non-traditional occupations and other relevant employment initiatives.
- Examples were identified of the development and use of measures to recruit and encourage entry to non-traditional areas, to encourage progression and to promote awareness and challenge stereotypes.
- Developments to advertising and recruitment processes were identified (e.g. general work to develop appropriate advertising; positive action statements; the use of targeted advertising; and marketing).
- A number of public authorities used events, roadshows and awareness days. Some organisations used other means, such as taster sessions, secondments, job shadowing, work placements and work experience, as well as role models and case studies. There were also examples of specific initiatives (e.g. incentives; development of general work in schools; use of press and TV etc.).
- A variety of forms of support were identified as being provided to enable women (or men) to work in non-traditional occupations, or to enable progression (e.g. mentoring; support and advice; support networks; single gender teams; and other forms of personal support).
- Many organisations identified developments in employment provisions which could help to address occupational segregation, including

reviewing and amending provision; extending provision; ensuring that both women and men took up opportunities; and promoting awareness.
- A number of organisations had undertaken, or were planning to undertake research relevant to addressing occupational segregation.
- A small number of organisations identified a role in tackling occupational segregation through the provision of funding (e.g. for specialist organisations, projects and initiatives).

7.6   Findings relating to developments to **training and awareness raising** which were of cross-cutting relevance were:

- Examples of training and awareness raising were identified in the evidence review and this research.
- Most public authorities in this study had undertaken training or awareness raising which was relevant to tackling occupational segregation. Much of this was at the level of general equality (or gender equality) training and awareness raising, although there were examples specific to occupational segregation.
- Relevant training within organisations included: training to guide practice; and training and awareness raising aimed at members of under-represented groups to address experiences of occupational segregation.
- There were also examples of other means of developing understanding among staff through the provision of guidance, tools and other advice.
- A number of examples were also given of other forms of training or awareness raising, such as seminars, workshops and events.
- Examples were identified of training and awareness raising with community members, involving work to address overall understanding of occupational segregation and to enable people to enter employment or undertake courses in non-traditional areas.

Developments relevant to specific portfolios

7.7   Some developments were of particular relevance to specific portfolios.

Health and wellbeing

7.8   Findings of particular relevance to **health and wellbeing** were:

- In terms of equality, there were many links between developing work to tackle occupational segregation and the development of equalities work locally and nationally. The role of equalities staff was also identified. Similarly, equality and diversity strategies, or HR strategies, generally provided the framework within which work to tackle occupational segregation took place.
- EQIAs were found to have been conducted in many organisations in relation to employment policies, with some developments to the EQIA processes overall. Fewer had a direct focus on occupational segregation.

- Many references were identified to organisations following good equalities practice in recruitment processes and procedures, and this was widely seen to impact upon tackling occupational segregation.
- There were examples of the use of positive action initiatives and single gender work in recruitment and training and awareness raising, with some gender-specific programmes and the provision of (or access to) training through a women's network or development organisation.
- The links between equality training and tackling occupational segregation were noted, with a number of developments identified (e.g. the development of content; training with a focus on particular staff etc.).
- In terms of tackling poverty, actions relating to equal pay were highlighted frequently, and a number of examples were given of perceived improvements to this within organisations.
- In terms of health, relevant work was identified in some health organisations. The Agenda for Change process in the NHS led to pay and grading work. There were also examples of various other forms of work taking place in some NHS organisations, often related to their own workforces.
- In terms of performance issues, there was evidence of some developments to monitoring performance through the collection of increased information, or work to analyse this. There was also some evidence of the use of information gathered to inform equalities work (or wider equalities data).
- In sport, an example of a large scale positive action initiative was identified.
- Some of the work undertaken as part of the regeneration agenda (e.g. targeted employment work) was seen to have had a role in tackling occupational segregation, even where this was not identified as a specific purpose.

Finance and sustainable growth

7.9 Findings of particular relevance to **finance and sustainable growth** were:

- In terms of local government, work was identified of all of the types highlighted, with developments to structural arrangements, information, initiatives, training and awareness raising. There were examples of a small number of holistic positive action programmes to tackle occupational segregation.
- In a small number of cases, references were made to occupational segregation in SOAs (and in business or corporate plans), although this varied. Some presented information about statutory performance indicators.
- Local authorities (through single status) had gone through wide-ranging and structured programmes of review and, where necessary, re-grading (with many examples of work relating to equal pay). There were also examples of developments to workplace provision, recruitment, information provision, support and initiatives.

- Local authorities were also involved in some initiatives to promote work in non-traditional areas (e.g. through Modern Apprenticeships, work in schools and workforce initiatives) with some examples of staff working in non-traditional roles.
- There was some evidence of positive changes to employment patterns, with examples of positive changes in the representation of women at senior levels and employment in non-traditional areas.
- In terms of enterprise, there were a number of examples of partnership working by individual organisations, particularly those with a role in enterprise and economic development in Scotland.
- There were some examples of initiatives which involved work with, or links to specific industry or sectoral bodies, forums or organisations (e.g. a college working with partners in the construction sector).
- There were examples of the use of employment initiatives to address occupational segregation (e.g. particular programmes). The relevance of initiatives to assist women to return to work, or to go into business, was identified. The relevance of other targeted employment initiatives (e.g. to assist groups into work) was also noted.
- In terms of the economy, there was evidence of recognition by some organisations of the links between tackling occupational segregation and wider economic development (e.g. in the presentation of labour market or contextual information in schemes), although this was relatively uncommon.

Education and lifelong learning

7.10 Findings of particular relevance to **education and lifelong learning** were:

- Educational institutions were involved in a range of types of work to tackle occupational segregation, and there were examples of aims, objectives and commitments to improve the gender balance in subject choice.
- Developments to advertising and marketing to encourage entry to non-traditional courses by HFE organisations were identified.
- The role of staff providing careers and development advice and guidance was identified, and there were examples of work to help overcome stereotypes in career and subject choice. Some examples were identified of the development of awareness among staff providing advice (e.g. careers staff), and education staff more widely.
- There was evidence of work to review learning and teaching materials to ensure that these were appropriate. The relevance of Curriculum for Excellence was identified and some noted the use of particular materials such as the "Teachers' Toolkit on Gender Equality in Education" and "Career Box" as well as other materials.
- A range of other means were used by schools and HFE institutions to tackle occupational segregation and challenge stereotypes, including: awareness days, the use of role models and case studies etc.
- There were a number of examples of partnership working by HFE institutions, including with schools and bodies in industry sectors.

- A number of HFE institutions were (or intended to be) signatories to the Athena Swan Charter, which commits those involved to tackling the unequal representation of women in science.
- There were examples of developments to information gathering and monitoring within educational institutions, such as the collection of information on numbers of students, subject choices and attainment by gender.
- Examples were identified of training and awareness raising for community members to address understanding of occupational segregation, and to enable them to enter employment or undertake courses in non-traditional areas (e.g. promotion of opportunities; campaign work; specific discussions, courses and sessions; use of materials).
- Within colleges and universities, examples were identified of training and courses to promote or assist entry to non-traditional roles. A number of these were gender-specific, and some work with members of the wider community was linked to positive action initiatives. Examples of initiatives designed to assist women to return to work, or to go into business, were identified.
- Access or preparatory courses (or less formal events) were also identified, designed to encourage consideration of courses in non-traditional areas, or work in non-traditional roles.
- Work has been carried out through Modern Apprenticeships, Skillseekers and other forms of vocational training, and tackling occupational segregation was seen to have been an important focus of the work of key national programmes.
- A small number of examples were identified of work to enable women in the community to progress in their sector (e.g. developments to qualifications).
- Some examples were provided of positive changes to subject choice, courses and vocational training, as well as involvement in non-traditional courses, increases in the number of apprenticeships, Skillseekers and work experience placements in non-traditional areas (although there remained issues).

Justice

7.11 Findings of particular relevance to **justice** were:

- There were examples from individual police forces and nationally of work to address occupational segregation, in the range of ways identified.
- There were examples of specific structural developments in individual police forces and nationally (e.g. forums and networks; specialist staff) to consider occupational segregation and develop work to address this.
- There were examples in the police of using workforce policies and provisions to tackle issues such as inflexibility and the long hours culture, as well as to address other barriers to recruitment and progression.

- Police were also involved in work to challenge stereotypes, promote opportunities and encourage recruitment from under-represented groups.
- There were examples of positive action in police forces to raise awareness and encourage women into particular areas of under-representation, including some specialist posts (e.g. awareness days and sessions).
- Training was also provided to enable development and progression (for men and women) and to enable access to policing as a career.
- It was suggested that there had been an increase both in the overall number of women police officers, and in the number of women in promoted police posts between 2003 and 2008.
- Some examples were given of an increased number of women in areas which were traditionally male-dominated (although it was recognised that there remained issues with this).

Rural affairs and the environment

7.12 Findings of particular relevance to **rural affairs and the environment** were:

- In addition to organisations in rural areas undertaking work of the types described within their own organisations, there were examples of some partnership working.
- Some organisations identified specific challenges facing organisations in rural areas in addressing occupational segregation (e.g. workforce, resource and practical issues).
- Organisations in rural areas were found to have been involved in intranet-based awareness raising to enable participation by those in isolated areas.

Implications

7.13 Overall, although progress was recognised in a number of areas, there were clear variations, with some organisations in which little, or no work was taking place. There was also evidence of continuing occupational segregation (both vertical and horizontal) and a need for the continuation and development of the types of work identified. Organisations also identified the potential for further work at a national and local level relating to:

- Leadership and clear policy direction, a consistent message, a clear definition of the issues to be addressed and specified expectations, supported by target-setting and a focus on outcomes.
- Clear, transparent and appropriate structures, with a strategic and co-ordinated approach, commitment and responsibility at all levels, and clear links between relevant work.
- Good equalities practice and mainstreaming, joined-up working; consultation, engagement and involvement, and a focus on appropriate ways of working.
- Improvements in the level of understanding of the issue, with: specific training on occupational segregation; advice, guidance, feedback and

examples of good practice; pilot projects; a national campaign; and other work.
- Developments to monitoring and reporting, including: better collection, analysis and reporting; consistency; effective use of EQIAs; national support for monitoring; and national information broken down at a local level.
- New initiatives, with proactive work and positive action across a range of areas and types of organisations and with a range of groups.
- Resources to support work, including: funding (overall and for specific programmes and positive action); materials; and appropriate timescales.

Summary of issues: links to ministerial portfolios

7.14 This section has presented a summary of the main points from throughout the report, making further summary here inappropriate. It is clear, however, that many of the findings of the research have cross-cutting implications for all ministerial portfolios, while some of the specific findings may be of particular relevance to some of the individual portfolios. These have been drawn out above.

ANNEX 1: METHODOLOGY

This annex details the aims, objectives and methodology for the work described in this report.

The research involved the examination of two issues in parallel. One of these (the subject of this report) related to the identification of progress by public authorities in Scotland in tackling occupational segregation, the other to the identification of progress in tackling violence against women. The overall aims and objectives of the research covered both of these issues, and the same method was used for each.

Aims and objectives

The aims of the overall project (encompassing both occupational segregation and violence against women) were identified in the brief as follows:

- Through a **public authority document review**, to: scope out, collate and review a sample of public authority documents that demonstrate the progress they have made toward equality of opportunity between women and men in relation to the two priority areas; and
- Through **fieldwork (case studies)**, to: identify and interview key people in a sample of Scottish public authorities (drawn from the sample in the public authority document review) responsible for promoting equality of opportunity between women and men in their authority. The purpose of 'case studies' would be to evidence 'good practice' examples of progress made in relation to tackling violence against women and occupational segregation and collate any relevant research / consultation reports and unpublished (i.e. not in the public domain) documents, data and evidence that also demonstrate progress made.

The objectives of the project relating to the **public authority document review**, were to:

- Draw a sample of Scottish public authorities to scope out and collate published (i.e. publicly available) documents produced to evidence the progress made in relation to the Gender Equality Duty.
- Ensure the sample drawn is stratified in relation to, for example, geographical location, size of public authority and whether the public authority is a health, police, education or local authority (and so on).
- Agree the above sample with Research Advisory.
- Review the documents collated to provide an overview of evidence on progress made in the context of the two priority areas.

The objectives relating to the **fieldwork (case studies)** were to:

- (From the sample and evidence in the public authority document review) draw a sample of Scottish public authorities to include as case studies ('good practice' examples).
- Agree the above sample with Research Advisory Group.

- From those public authorities included in the above sample, identify key people responsible for promoting equality of opportunity.
- Ensure key people in the sample have knowledge of what their authority is doing to progress equality of opportunity between women and men in the context of the two priority areas.
- Develop interview schedules to assist discussions with these key people.
- Ensure all relevant parties sign-off interview schedules (i.e. Research Advisory Group).
- Arrange interviews with key people responsible for promoting equality of opportunity.
- Ensure that interviews capture how different public authorities work together to address the priority areas.
- Collate any unpublished (i.e. not in the public domain) documents, data and evidence from these public authorities.
- Where available, ensure the 'good practice' examples are evidenced – e.g. collate any reports related to research and consultations undertaken with stakeholders and in particular service users that evidence the authorities' good practice.

As noted in Section 1, in addition to this research, an evidence review was carried out in-house by the Scottish Government to scope, collate and review research evidence, statistical data and Scottish Government policy documents in the two priority areas, with a separate report prepared.

It is important to bear in mind that the aims and objectives of the research described in this report did not require an evaluation of the work undertaken, nor an audit of either individual schemes or progress made in achieving targets within them. The focus was primarily on the identification of examples of progress, rather than an assessment of gaps. Additionally, no comment is offered on the quality or effectiveness of policies and initiatives identified in the text, and the identification of examples does not indicate their endorsement or evaluation.

The Research Advisory Group

The research was overseen by a Research Advisory Group, with members from the Equality Unit and the Social Inclusion and Equalities Analysis Team within the Scottish Government and the research team.

Methods used

The research involved a number of stages and a combination of research methods. There are currently around 300 public authorities covered by the Gender Equality Duty. This meant that there was a need to draw a sample for the document review and case studies. It was identified that these public authorities fell into a number of broad categories by type of function:

- Local authorities.
- Education authorities.
- NHS boards.
- Police forces.

- Further education colleges.
- Higher education institutions.
- Fire services.
- Licensing boards covering various functions.
- Specialist national organisations.
- Scottish Ministers.

Document review

Given the purpose of this report, the sample was selected to include those considered most likely to generate examples of progress in tackling occupational segregation or violence against women (as the same sample covered both issues), and was not random. The basis of the selection of the sample for the document review was as follows:

- The need to make sure that the sample reflected different geographical locations, sizes and types of public authority.
- The need, given the purpose of the research, to include organisations whose operational area or particular role was especially relevant to one or other priority, where there seemed to be particularly innovative work taking place, and organisations that would have a particular role in partnership working.

Organisations with key roles were identified first and the largest number sampled from these. The sample also included additional organisations with a relevant role, and a small number of others. Preliminary work was carried out to try to identify those organisations with a key role which were carrying out current and recent work. An early basic exploration of "visible" work was undertaken, and an initial sample suggested which was discussed with the Research Advisory Group. Discussions were also held with some organisations with expertise in the key areas of work. The sample was based on the information from this early work (in conjunction with the criteria described above).

The sample included a total of 75 organisations in Scotland, comprising:

- All police forces.
- 18 local authorities (including 18 education authorities).
- 1 education authority which operates as an independent school;
- 7 NHS boards.
- 10 further education institutions.
- 5 universities.
- 7 individual organisations with a key role in addressing one or both of the issues (tackling occupational segregation or violence against women).
- 8 individual organisations with a relevant role in addressing one or both of the issues.
- 8 other organisations.
- 3 umbrella bodies (not specifically covered by the Gender Equality Duty but which also undertook relevant work).

Although it had originally been intended to treat local authorities and education authorities as separate entities for the purposes of the document review and case

studies, it was agreed instead that both aspects of their work would be explored in each case. The primary reason for this was that much of the policy framework underpinning gender equality, and much of the work taking place under the auspices of gender (or single) equality schemes would include education. Further, the examination of documents for one aspect of the organisation would identify information pertaining to the other. Thus, for both the document review and case studies, all of the work taking place in local authorities was covered (including education authorities), regardless of the basis of the original choice. The practical effect of this was to greatly extend the number of local authorities and education authorities covered. In the report, references to "local authority" should be taken to cover work undertaken in both local authorities and / or education authorities unless otherwise stated.

The document review process for each public authority involved a number of stages:

- Identification of and access to the key published documents (through an internet search and subsequent follow-up with identified contacts).
- Close examination of each of the documents for information pertinent to this research, and extraction of the information.
- Entry of the details of the relevant material to a pro forma using a reading framework.

Identification of, and access to documents

For each of the organisations included in the document review, relevant material was identified initially through an internet search. The starting point was generally the gender equality or single equality scheme, with further documents identified from those, including progress reports, policy documents and other relevant reports. Where wider, or partnership documents (such as Single Outcome Agreements or community planning strategies) were identified as making specific reference to occupational segregation, these were also included. Where key reports were found to be unavailable, direct contact was made with public authorities, and, in most cases, these were obtained.

The documents examined largely covered the period from 2007 (the commencement of the Gender Equality Duty) to approximately January 2010. Most public authorities produced either a single equality scheme, or a gender equality scheme covering a three year period. In most cases, the period covered was 2007-2010, although the document review included available schemes which covered any part of the period covered by the research (for example, a number of single equality schemes dated 2005-2008 were included). In a small number of cases, public bodies had, by the cut off date for the document review, published schemes for a new period (e.g. 2010 onwards), effectively superseding their original scheme and these were also included in the document review.

Progress reports available to January 2010[18] were included in the document review. Generally, this meant that progress reports for 2009 were included, although in a small number of cases, public authorities indicated that they did not intend to publish

---

[18] The Scottish Ministers' progress report, published in April 2010, was also included.

these until a date later in 2010 (for example, to fit with committee cycles). A small number of documents, despite efforts to obtain them, proved to be unavailable.

It was agreed by the Research Advisory Group (RAG) RAG that the examination of issues relating to Equality Impact Assessments should be undertaken through the case studies, rather than through the document review. Some organisations carried out many such assessments (in a range of areas). Some of these, however, made little or no reference to the issues being examined. It was considered that the most effective approach (rather than reading many EQIAs which would yield little information) was to ask participants at interview to highlight any which provided particular examples of good practice in relation to each of the areas under examination.

It is important to bear in mind that, while most public authorities developed and agreed their gender equality (or single equality) schemes in 2006 or 2007, tackling occupational segregation was not identified as a specific ministerial priority until 2009. It may be that schemes currently being developed for 2010 onwards reflect this change.

The inclusion of the case studies helped to ensure that, whatever the availability and timescale of the documents, examples of up to date and current work were identified.

Examination and entry of documents

A reading framework was used to guide the document review. The purpose of the framework was to ensure that the information gathered from the documents related to the types of evidence which would demonstrate or indicate progress. The framework covered material which indicated:

- An identified objective, aim or commitment to tackling the issue.
- Relevant policies or strategies.
- Provision or development of support, specific initiatives or services.
- Relevant training or awareness raising.
- Work with particular groups.
- Development of structures and mechanisms.
- Information gathering, monitoring and reporting.
- Partnership working.
- Evidence of work by other public authorities.

A Microsoft Access database was designed to contain the information and to facilitate the analysis.

Case studies

A total of 31 case studies were carried out, with public authorities being drawn from those included in the document review. The sample was selected using the knowledge from the first sift along with the information from expert organisations and RAG members. It covered a range of locations and types of authorities, as well as examples of work of different types. Only one public authority declined to participate. One further public authority agreed to participate, but was unable to do so within the agreed timescale.

The final case study sample comprised:

- 6 police forces.
- 11 local authorities, including 11 education authorities.
- 4 NHS boards.
- 7 colleges and universities.
- 3 specialist national organisations.

Within this, all of the relevant public authorities in two geographical areas were selected to provide examples of partnership working.

Additionally, a request was received from a national membership organisation (covering public authorities from one of the categories above). With the agreement of the RAG, an interview was undertaken with a representative of that organisation, and the material from this was included in the analysis on the same basis as other interview data.

A total of 102 staff participated in individual or group discussions. Of these, four individual interviews were undertaken by telephone.

Interview schedules were designed to cover interviews with: staff with responsibility for tackling occupational segregation; staff with responsibility for tackling violence against women; staff with responsibility for tackling both issues; and staff in educational organisations. It is not possible to present a definitive breakdown of the interviews and group discussions by priority as a large majority covered *both* topics, at least to some extent, even where the main focus of the discussion was on either occupational segregation or violence against women. The length of interviews ranged from 45 to 90 minutes. Group discussions ranged from 1 to 2 hours.

A Microsoft Access database was used to store the information.

Analysis of the data and preparation of the final report

The final strand of the methodology involved the analysis of the data and preparation of the final report.

All of the data was analysed and presented qualitatively. It would have been inappropriate to carry out a quantitative analysis for a number of reasons:

- This research was not intended to be an audit of work being carried out by public authorities, and, for this reason, relied on information which was either publicly available, or which could be sourced directly from organisations.
- Some public authorities made documents such as departmental level action plans publicly available, whereas in other cases, these were only accessible within the organisation.
- There was a wide variation in the nature and coverage of both gender and single equality schemes, as well as wider strategic documents such as community plans, SOAs or business plans. The inclusion of organisations of different types meant that the range of relevant documents for each varied.

- There was no means of verifying definitively whether work which was identified had taken place in all cases and it was necessary to assume, in some cases that this was the case.
- Some of the material obtained from individual public bodies (or indirectly from partnerships or umbrella bodies) indicated that work was taking place which was not referred to specifically in public authorities' own documents.
- There was wide variation in the way individual types of work, and individual policies were described by public authorities. This was particularly evident in considering public authorities' policies in relation to issues such as support for employees, and training and awareness raising. Without a detailed audit of each individual type, it would have been impossible to compare the content of these across public authorities.
- While the research could identify work which was taking place, it could not identify definitively where work was not taking place. The methodology specified for this research made it impossible to be definitive about whether or not an individual public authority was, or was not carrying out specific types of work.

As noted, data from the document review was entered into an Access database, designed around the issues in the reading framework (described earlier). The material gathered from the case studies was entered into separate tables within the same Access database.

The databases were used to generate a series of Word documents covering each issue within the reading frameworks and interview schedules, tied to a unique identifier for each public authority. The material in these documents was then analysed to identify the overall "themes" pertaining to that issue, any "sub-themes" which emerged and detailed material from the organisations. From these documents, a summary of findings in relation to progress on each aspect of tackling occupational segregation was prepared, including identifying details and examples of the types of work which had been carried out. The summaries developed from the document review, and the interviews and group discussions were combined, and used to prepare the final report.

This method allowed the data to be organised and summarised, while maintaining the richness of the source data and ensuring that the evidence for inclusion in the reports was generated from the material.

The final report

A structure for the final report was agreed with the Scottish Government, with the focus upon the findings of the document review and case studies (although reference is made to the Scottish Government's in-house evidence review).

ANNEX 2:   ABBREVIATIONS / ACRONYMS

EQIA	Equality Impact Assessment
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women
CoSLA	Convention of Scottish Local Authorities
CPD	Continuing Professional Development
HFE	Higher and Further Education
HNC	Higher National Certificate
HR	Human Resources
IT	Information Technology
ONS	Office for National Statistics
OSWG	Occupational Segregation Working Group
PSE	Personal and Social Education
PSV	Public Service Vehicle
RAG	Research Advisory Group
RHA	Reid Howie Associates
SCC	School-College Collaboration
SEEMIS	Management information system on which school attendance is recorded
SOA	Single Outcome Agreement
SQA	Scottish Qualifications Authority
STEM	Science Technology Engineering and Maths
SVQs	Scottish Vocational Qualifications
VT	Vocational Training

GOVERNMENT SOCIAL RESEARCH

Social Science in Government